

DRAFT

1. FINAL RECOMMENDATION

As noted in Section 5 of the report, Alternatives 1(a) and 3(a) were initially advanced for further study while the other design alternatives under consideration were not recommended for advancement. Following the subsequent introduction of Build Alternatives 6(a) and 6(b), it was determined that components of 1(a), such as downtown turning radii improvements, could be folded into all of the remaining alternatives. Consequently, Alternative 1(a) is no longer recommended for further study. The following discussion summarizes the final recommendations of the study and the reasons for advancing or dropping each alternative.

Alternative 1(a): Existing Alignment Improvements

Implementing improvements within the confines of the existing corridor is the most cost efficient option under consideration for improving traffic flow within the Highway 138 corridor. Nonetheless, Alternative 1(a) limits facility improvements to such items as roadway widening, re-striping, and signal improvements and does not add substantial new capacity to the system. The option is viewed by some as an interim short-term proposal for what could be an eventual large-scale, long-term corridor improvement.

Strengths

- Least costly alternative
- Earliest implementation timeline
- Minimal physical impact
- Would bring intersection design close to ODOT standards

Weaknesses

- Would not resolve Diamond Lake Boulevard – Stephens intersection operations.
- Would not adequately address downtown circulation issues
- Would not provide a grade-separated rail crossing
- Potential impact associated with the new public safety building due to roadway widening along Stephens Street

Recommendation

Originally recommended for further study based on its ability to provide roadway improvements at relatively low cost with the least physical impact, component improvements of the alternative will instead be folded into Alternatives 3(a) and 6(a).

DRAFT

Alternative 2(a): Harvard-Washington-Stephens-Diamond Lake Alignment

Incorporating a wider, multi-lane, two-way corridor into the downtown core, Alternative 2(a) would increase capacity on the Washington Avenue Bridge. Although possessing a few strengths, the option also has several associated negatives.

Strengths

- Increased capacity on Washington Avenue Bridge and into downtown
- Would allow enhanced downtown access to the riverfront south of Washington Avenue.

Weaknesses

- Too convoluted and confusing
- Too disruptive to downtown (not likely to receive support from business owners)
- Would not move congestion out of downtown
- Would not address problems at the Stephens/Diamond Lake intersection
- Would create huge intersections
- No grade-separated rail crossing
- Would not meet long-term goals
- Interruption of north-south Stephens and Pine Street movements
- Potential queuing and safety issues

Recommendation

Alternative 2(a) is considered too costly with minimal benefit; therefore, it is not recommended for further study.

Alternative 2(c): Harvard-Washington-Rose-Diamond Lake Alignment

This second version of the downtown corridor alignment option has a more physical impact due to the north-south alignment along Rose Street instead of Stephens Street as proposed under Alternative 2(a). The necessary widening of Rose Street would require acquisition and demolition of existing structures along the roadway.

Strengths

- Increased capacity on Washington Avenue Bridge and into downtown
- Would allow enhanced downtown access to the riverfront south of Washington Avenue.

DRAFT

Weaknesses

- Too convoluted
- Overly disruptive to downtown
- Would alter the travel patterns downtown
- No grade-separated rail crossing
- Potential impact to the proposed public safety building site
- Downtown economic growth hindered by limiting redevelopment opportunities such as the former Safeway site

Recommendation

Due to potential impacts to traffic flow and lost economic development opportunities for redevelopment within the downtown area, Alternative 2(c) is not recommended for further study.

Alternative 3(a): Harvard-Diamond Lake Bridge Connection (RR At-Grade)

Implementing Design Alternative 3(a) would realign Highway 138 north of downtown Roseburg and provide the most direct connection between Harvard Avenue and Diamond Lake Boulevard. The configuration would require closure and possibly demolition of the Washington Avenue Bridge. The build alternative (as with the other direct connection alternatives) represents an opportunity to introduce a signature bridge provided that aesthetic features are emphasized during its design. However, the added emphasis on aesthetics would likely result in additional costs to the project. Nonetheless, the alternative would enhance regional connectivity and could potentially serve as a gateway to the Crater Lake region. The most frequent criticism of the option is that does not incorporate a grade-separated crossing of the railroad line. Sizeable environmental impacts are associated with the concept option, most predominant being the bridge crossing over Elk Island and the confluence of Deer Creek into the South Umpqua River.

Strengths

- Project purpose and most of the project needs addressed
- Direct connection between Harvard Avenue and Diamond Lake Boulevard
- Highway 138 through traffic routed out of downtown
- Enhanced opportunity for economic development along the Diamond Lake Boulevard corridor
- Potential for access to new recreational areas (e.g. Elk Island)
- Enhanced regional connectivity
- Bicycle and pedestrian facilities included on new bridge

DRAFT

Weaknesses

- No grade-separated rail crossing
- Costly (aesthetic design considerations would likely inflate the costs further)
- Potential visual and noise impact to the Laurelwood neighborhood
- Environmental impacts associated with a new bridge crossing the South Umpqua River and in the vicinity of the Deer Creek confluence with the South Umpqua River.
- High cost on a regional highway (ODOT prioritization) likely to make funding more difficult without significant contribution from local community

Recommendation

(Placeholder)

Alternative 3(d): Harvard-Diamond Lake Bridge (RR Above-Grade)

Alternative 3(d) maintains the same roadway corridor alignments Alternative 3(a) but it also incorporates grade separation of the railroad line by constructing a viaduct and elevating the railroad bed above the realigned corridor and downtown Roseburg. The build alternative (as with the other direct connection alternatives) represents an opportunity to introduce a signature bridge provided that aesthetic features are emphasized during its design. However, the added emphasis on aesthetics would likely result in additional costs to the project. Nonetheless, the alternative would enhance regional connectivity and could potentially serve as a gateway to the Crater Lake region. Although this concept would remedy most of the deficiencies discussed in Section 1, the impacts to the city are substantial.

Strengths

- Project purpose and most of the project needs addressed
- Direct access between Harvard Avenue and Diamond Lake Boulevard
- Grade-separated rail crossing
- Highway 138 through traffic routed out of downtown
- Enhanced opportunity for economic development along the Diamond Lake Boulevard corridor
- Potential for access to new recreational areas (e.g. Elk Island)
- Enhanced regional connectivity
- Bicycle and pedestrian facilities included on new bridge

DRAFT

Weaknesses

- Most expensive alternative (aesthetic design considerations would likely inflate the costs further)
- Most impacts (physical, visual, noise, historic) of any alternative
- Potential visual and noise impact to the Laurelwood neighborhood and Downtown.
- Environmental impacts associated with a new bridge crossing the South Umpqua River and in the vicinity of the Deer Creek confluence with the South Umpqua River.
- Railroad viaduct would convey the appearance of blocked riverfront access
- Extremely high cost on a regional highway would make funding infeasible given priorities throughout ODOT

Recommendation

Alternative 3(d) would have cost and impacts to the downtown historic district, impose a physical barrier on either side of the railroad viaduct, and alter the character of the city; therefore, it is not recommended for further study.

Alternative 4(a): Northern Alignment Flyover (RR Below-Grade)

Although the design alternative addresses the needs statements outline in Section 1, it does so at a high monetary cost and physical impact to the city. The proposal would align a new bridge and corridor over the South Umpqua River and Elk Island and over the railroad line, Stephens Street and Winchester Street north of the existing Diamond Lake Boulevard alignment. The configuration would require closure of the Washington Avenue Bridge. The descent of the new bridge on the east side of the river would cross over the Winchester Street alignment at a clearance that will prevent north-south movement. Subsequently, Winchester Street would cease being a through route. The build alternative (as with the other direct connection alternatives) represents an opportunity to introduce a signature bridge provided that aesthetic features are emphasized during its design. However, the added emphasis on aesthetics would likely result in additional costs to the project. Nonetheless, the alternative would enhance regional connectivity and could potentially serve as a gateway to the Crater Lake region.

DRAFT

Strengths

- Project purpose and most of the project needs addressed
- Direct access between Harvard Avenue and Diamond Lake Boulevard
- Some Highway 138 through traffic rerouted out of downtown
- Grade-separated railroad crossing
- Possesses elements that meet original goals
- Enhanced opportunity for economic development along the Diamond Lake Boulevard corridor
- Potential for access to new recreational areas (e.g. Elk Island)
- Enhanced regional connectivity
- Bicycle and pedestrian facilities included on new bridge

Weaknesses

- Minimal benefit for the disruption that the alternative would impose
- Radical manipulation of traffic flows
- Costly (aesthetic design considerations would likely inflate the costs further)
- Construction of new bridge and widening of Oak Avenue Bridge required
- Sizeable impacts to river
- Potential visual and noise impact to the Laurelwood neighborhood
- Environmental impacts associated with a new bridge crossing the South Umpqua River and in the vicinity of the Deer Creek confluence with the South Umpqua River.
- High cost on a regional highway (ODOT prioritization) likely to make funding less feasible without significant contribution from local community

Recommendation

Alternative 4(a) is not recommended for further study. Although it achieves many of the goals and objectives of this study, the configuration would be too costly while providing minimal improvements to downtown traffic flow.

Alternative 6(a): Diamond Lake Boulevard – Odell Avenue Couplet

Alternative 6(a) focuses on improving traffic circulation in the vicinity of the Diamond Lake Boulevard/Stephens Street intersection by incorporating east-west and north-south couplets aligned with Diamond Lake Boulevard-Odell Avenue and Stephens Street-Winchester Street respectively. The implementation of the couplet system would simplify traffic signal phasing and generally improve traffic flow in the area.

Strengths

- Project purpose and most of the project needs addressed
- Less costly than most other alternative
- Relatively easy to implement

DRAFT

- Minimal physical impact
- Would bring intersection operations within ODOT standards
- Enhanced opportunity for economic development along the Diamond Lake Boulevard and possibly Odell Avenue corridor
- Improved bicycle, pedestrian, and transit facilities along the corridor.

Weaknesses

- Would not provide direct connection (Diamond Lake Boulevard to Harvard Avenue) that may be needed to support economic growth in the Diamond Lake corridor
- Would shift traffic from existing arterials to other roadways that currently carry lower volumes
- Downtown accessibility via Jackson St would be more limited
- Would not provide a grade-separated rail crossing

Recommendation

(Placeholder)

Alternative 6(b): Diamond Lake Boulevard – Odell Avenue Couplet with Direct Connection

Alternative 6(b) combines the benefits of the couplet system proposed with Alternative 6(a) with the realignment of Highway 138 onto a new direct connection between Harvard Avenue and Diamond Lake Boulevard as proposed with Alternative 3(a). The configuration would require closure and possibly demolition of the Washington Avenue Bridge. The build alternative (as with the other direct connection alternatives) represents an opportunity to introduce a signature bridge provided that aesthetic features are emphasized during its design. However, the added emphasis on aesthetics would likely result in additional costs to the project. Nonetheless, the alternative would enhance regional connectivity and could potentially serve as a gateway to the Crater Lake region. The most frequent criticism of the option is that does not incorporate a grade-separated crossing of the railroad line. Sizeable environmental impacts are associated with the concept option, most predominant being the bridge crossing over Elk Island and the confluence of Deer Creek into the South Umpqua River.

DRAFT

Strengths

- Project purpose and most of the project needs addressed
- Direct connection between Harvard Avenue and Diamond Lake Boulevard
- Highway 138 through traffic routed out of downtown
- Potential for access to new recreational areas (e.g. Elk Island)
- Enhanced regional connectivity
- Would bring intersection operations close to ODOT standards
- Enhanced opportunity for economic development along the Diamond Lake Boulevard and possibly Odell Avenue corridor
- Improved bicycle and pedestrian facilities in several corridors

Weaknesses

- No grade-separated rail crossing
- Costly (aesthetic design considerations would likely inflate the costs further)
- Potential visual and noise impact to the Laurelwood neighborhood
- Environmental impacts associated with a new bridge crossing the South Umpqua River and in the vicinity of the Deer Creek confluence with the South Umpqua River.
- High cost on a regional highway (ODOT prioritization) likely to make funding more difficult without significant contribution from local community
- Would shift traffic from existing arterials to other roadways that currently carry lower volumes
- Downtown accessibility via Jackson St would be more limited

Recommendation

(Placeholder)