

# Regional Mobility Pricing Project

## Memorandum

<b>Date</b>	March 29, 2023
<b>To</b>	EMAC Members
<b>From</b>	Oregon Toll Program Project Team
<b>Subject</b>	EMAC Accountability Case Studies Overview

### 1 Introduction

The [Equity and Mobility Advisory Committee](#) (EMAC), convened by the Oregon Department of Transportation (ODOT), provides recommendations to ODOT and the Oregon Transportation Commission (OTC) to advance equity in the Oregon Toll Program by centering BIPOC communities, persons experiencing low-incomes, and historically and currently excluded and underserved communities.

In 2022, the OTC adopted EMAC’s [Shaping an Equitable Toll Program: Recommendations to the OTC](#), which included a recommended action that “ODOT and the OTC support a toll equity accountability committee or establish another structure where equity voices are at the table in a consistent, transparent, and resource-supported way to ensure long-term accountability.” In 2023, EMAC is building upon this recommendation by envisioning an equitable process to sustain long-term accountability between ODOT and equity communities. EMAC is planning two annual workshops with ODOT, the first of which will be held in July 2023.

As EMAC considers options for a systemic equity process, the Oregon Toll Program project team has examined several case studies to inform EMAC’s recommendations. This memo summarizes five particularly relevant initiatives, which are briefly summarized in the table below. A matrix is provided as an attachment to this memo, which provides information on three additional case studies. This information will support an upcoming discussion in EMAC’s public Meeting #22 on April 5, during which members will discuss innovative ideas for engaging ODOT in developing a system for long-term accountability.

Project/Report	Location	Overview
Interstate Bridge Replacement Program (IBR) <a href="#">Accountability Dashboard</a>	Vancouver, WA Portland, OR	Online dashboard tracking various engagement metrics, project milestones, and financial information.
City of Seattle Race and Social Justice Initiative (RSJI) and <a href="#">City Racial Equity Actions Database</a>	Seattle, WA	Citywide initiative to improve racial equity and reduce race-based disparities in City government.
Washington Department of Transportation (WSDOT) <a href="#">Accountability</a>	Washington State	Robust reporting system to track performance metrics and progress on the WSDOT Strategic Plan.
Prosper Portland <a href="#">Construction Business &amp; Workforce Equity (CBWE) Dashboard</a>	Portland, OR	Dashboard tracking Disadvantaged Business Enterprises (DBEs) involvement in construction investments.
I-205 Construction <a href="#">Diversity and Workforce Dashboard</a>	Portland, OR	Dashboard tracking progress toward construction workforce and contractor diversity goals.

## 2 Accountability Case Studies

### Interstate Bridge Replacement Program (IBR) Accountability Dashboard

#### *Project Description*

The [Interstate Bridge Replacement Program](#) is currently in the design and environmental phase, and construction is tentatively slated to begin in 2026. This project will replace the aging Interstate 5 bridge connecting Portland, Oregon and Vancouver, Washington. IBR aims to center equity and follow a transparent, data-driven process that includes collaboration with local, state, federal and tribal partners<sup>1</sup>.

#### *Equity Metric Tracking and Reporting*

IBR uses an online [Accountability Dashboard](#) to report quarterly on community engagement efforts and biannually on other project metrics. The dashboard tracks three categories:

- Listening - Quantitative engagement metrics
- Learning - Changes to the project in response to community feedback
- Reporting - Legislative progress reports and financial information

The Learning section of the dashboard highlights three areas of community feedback. Clicking on each item then shows how the program is responding to the feedback.

- The community values low-barrier engagement options and the opportunity to have meaningful conversations with the program. In response, the program held an online roundtable event, provided additional presentations in the community, and shared additional information about the proposed design.
- The community is interested in learning more about how the program will impact them. The program is planning community engagement opportunities to support the Supplemental Draft EIS that will be released later in 2023.
- Social media is one of the preferred ways the community would like to be engaged. The program provides livestream options whenever possible and shares information across various social media channels.

#### *Implementation: Successes and Challenges*

Although the project has not yet been constructed, design and environmental work is underway, and the dashboard reports on the work that has been done to date. The IBR Accountability Dashboard successfully captures community input and tracks how the IBR program incorporated public direction into the project process.

---

<sup>1</sup> <https://www.interstatebridge.org/>, “Centering Equity” section

## **City of Seattle Race and Social Justice Initiative (RSJI)**

### *Project Description*

The City of Seattle implemented the [Race and Social Justice Initiative](#) (RSJI) in 2004 to eliminate racial disparities and achieve racial equity in Seattle City government. The project is implemented through four-year strategic plans, including the most recent [2022-2026 Strategic Plan](#). Goal 1 of the recent strategic plan is to embed racial equity into City of Seattle policies and processes using several strategies including:

- Support and convene racial equity Change Teams (dedicated to advancing equity in each City department), agency leadership, and Equity Leads to address race and social justice projects, priority issues, and Citywide trends,
- Facilitate quarterly race and social justice trainings for agency leadership,
- Co-facilitate the cross-agency Workforce Equity Planning & Advisory Committee (WEPAC) to develop workforce equity strategies, policies, trainings, and investments that support racial and social justice,
- Advocate for equitable budgeting during budget processes, and
- Strengthen Citywide use of the Racial Equity Toolkit (RET) and increase Citywide use of Racial Equity Action Plans.

### *Equity Metric Tracking and Reporting*

To track Racial Equity Plans and Actions, the City has developed a [City Racial Equity Actions database](#) to increase transparency and interdepartmental coordination. The public can access the Racial Equity Actions database to explore project plans and actions. Actions can be filtered by topic, City Department, planned year, and keyword, increasing transparency by allowing the public to explore initiatives that will directly impact their community. Each selected project provides detail including:

- What will be delivered
- Strategies for engaging the community
- Strategies for addressing race and social justice
- Desired outcomes
- Metrics for measuring each outcome
- Contact information for City staff lead

Departments use the Racial Equity Actions database to report and update their racial equity action plans, and progress reports or impact assessments are shared as they are developed. Plans are collected annually and updated in the first quarter of each year<sup>2</sup>.

---

<sup>2</sup> <https://www.seattle.gov/rsji/city-racial-equity-actions#/1>, "Why are we sharing our racial equity actions?" section

### *Oversight*

The RSJI provides multi-faceted programmatic support to City agencies, relying primarily on departmental Change Teams and Equity Leads to ensure implementation in each City department. RSJI builds internal capacity within Seattle City government to improve equity outcomes for Seattle residents. The Initiative aims to foster internal oversight and accountability through organizational culture change.

Notably, the Seattle Department of Transportation (SDOT) created a [Transportation Equity Program](#) (TEP) and a [Transportation Equity Workgroup](#) (TEW) to build upon the RSJI. TEW members are paid advisors who commit up to 10 hours per month for the duration of a two-year term. In 2022, the TEW recommended that SDOT permanently fund the advisory body to ensure sustained commitment to creating equitable outcomes for equity communities<sup>3</sup>.

### *Implementation: Successes and Challenges*

The Racial Equity Actions database was a product of community feedback received in 2019. Activists asked the City of Seattle to do a better job of ensuring that multiple projects and stakeholder engagement events occurring in the same neighborhoods were coordinated and working toward the same outcomes<sup>4</sup>. The City developed the database to address the concern related to interdepartmental coordination while also improving transparency and accountability.

## **Washington State Department of Transportation (WSDOT) Accountability**

### *Project Description*

The Washington State Department of Transportation (WSDOT) demonstrates agency performance on its [Accountability portal](#), which hosts multi-disciplinary reports, regulations, and data, including:

- Bike & walk reports
- Diversity, equity and inclusion
- [Gray Notebook](#), WSDOT's quarterly performance report
- Maintenance accountability process
- Tolling reports & policy, and
- Transportation performance management.

Notably, WSDOT's Toll Division, which administers tolling in the Seattle region, releases a report each fiscal year to share information about operations. The [Fiscal Year 2022 Toll Division Annual Report](#) includes express toll lane performance metrics, including traffic volumes and transit use specific to the express lanes, progress on achieving business plan goals, collected revenues, and operational expenses. The 2022 Toll Division Annual report does not include any metrics specific to equity. The report does provide an update on WSDOT's *Good To Go!* Program aimed at addressing customer issues.

---

<sup>3</sup>[https://www.seattle.gov/documents/Departments/SDOT/TransportationEquity/TransportationEquity\\_Framework\\_Report\\_41422.pdf](https://www.seattle.gov/documents/Departments/SDOT/TransportationEquity/TransportationEquity_Framework_Report_41422.pdf), p. 24

<sup>4</sup> <https://www.seattle.gov/rsji/city-racial-equity-actions#1>, "Why are we sharing our racial equity actions?" section

### *Equity Metric Tracking and Reporting*

The WSDOT [Diversity, Equity and Inclusion \(DEI\) accountability](#) category tracks policies, regulations, and initiatives dedicated to advancing equitable policy within WSDOT. This includes a 2021 executive order to advance internal anti-racist policies, the 2022 Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Plan to advance DEI in the workplace, and various equity assessments. Diversity, Equity and Inclusion is included as an internal and external goal in the WSDOT Strategic Plan<sup>5</sup>, yet WSDOT does not currently report externally on equity performance metrics.

### *Implementation: Successes and Challenges*

These reports are well-written, well-organized, incorporate graphics, and use plain language wherever possible. Furthermore, WSDOT centralizes all accountability efforts on a single webpage that organizes reporting efforts by discipline, creating a simple online navigation system.

## **Prosper Portland**

### *Project Description*

[Prosper Portland](#), the economic and urban development agency for the City of Portland, adopted the Construction Business & Workforce Equity Policy (CBWE)<sup>6</sup> on April 14, 2021, to ensure construction and contracting investments provided equitable opportunities for underrepresented populations on agency-funded projects. The CBWE establishes two different programs (1) the Workforce Training and Hiring Program; and (2) the Business Equity Program.

The [Workforce Training and Hiring Program](#) identifies specific steps for contractors, developers, and borrowers conducting work on Prosper Portland's behalf to maximize apprenticeship and job opportunities in the construction trades for women and people of color. The [Business and Equity Program](#) (BEP) is charged with ensuring Prosper Portland's projects provide professional, supplier and construction contracting opportunities to businesses certified by the Certification Office for Business Inclusion and Diversity.

### *Equity Metric Tracking and Reporting*

To track the CBWE programs, Prosper Portland developed a [public accountability data dashboard](#) for projects currently undergoing construction or completed within the last three years where Prosper Portland's BEP policy applies. For projects that are under construction, data is updated quarterly to reflect project progress. The dashboard illustrates how each project is performing against specific goals and requirements. The metrics used to measure progress for the CBWE programs are summarized below.

The Business Equity Program's goals for the utilization of Certified Firms are as follows:

- 22% of an applicable project's total Hard Construction Costs are allocated to any combination of DBE and/or MBE firms.
- 20% of the project's professional services costs allocated to Certified Firms.

---

<sup>5</sup> <https://wsdot.wa.gov/about/secretary-transportation/strategic-plan>, "Goals" and "Diversity, Equity and Inclusion" sections

<sup>6</sup> <https://prosperportland.us/wp-content/uploads/2022/01/Construction-Business-and-Workforce-Equity-Policy.pdf>

The Workforce Training and Hiring Program has mandatory program requirements that the contractor and subcontractors utilize state-registered apprentices for 20% of labor hours in each apprenticeable trade. The Policy also includes aspirational goals for a percentage of total hours on the project going to people of color and women. The aspirational goals increase from year to year.

*Implementation: Successes and Challenges*

Prosper Portland's accountability data dashboard successfully tracks projects' performance against the various CBWE program requirements and goals. It is easy to navigate, and the metrics presented in the dashboard represent the key requirements for both CBWE programs. The adopted CBWE Resolution included accountability, further strengthening the City's commitment to continuously monitor and report to the appropriate stakeholders and update the online dashboard.

## **I-205 Improvements Project Construction Dashboard**

*Project Description*

The [I-205 Toll and Improvements Project](#) is part of the Oregon Department of Transportation's (ODOT) Comprehensive Congestion Management and Mobility Plan to reduce congestion and improve safety. The first phase of project will upgrade the Abernethy Bridge to withstand a major earthquake, improve interchanges at OR 43 and OR 99E, along with improving on-and off ramps to increase safety. Toll revenue will be needed to construct the missing third lane and complete seismic improvements.

*Equity Metric Tracking and Reporting*

ODOT developed the [Diversity and Workforce dashboard](#) to show the I-205 Improvements Project's progress toward construction workforce and contractor diversity goals for the first phase of construction. The dashboard is updated monthly. The prime contractor, Kiewit Infrastructure West Company, must make a good-faith effort to meet these goals by completion of the first phase. ODOT meets with Kiewit monthly to review progress and identify opportunities for improvement where performance is falling short of the goal(s).

The I-205 Improvements Project goals for construction workforce and contractor diversity goals are as follows:

- 14% of total construction contract dollars paid to date certified DBEs by completion
- Monthly apprenticeship and on-the-job trainee (OJT) hours by trade
  - 20% of workforce hours for all non-operating engineer apprenticeable trades and crafts.
  - 15% of workforce hours of operating engineers
- 5% of Tribal Employment Rights Office (TERO) referred workers
- 8% of contract workforce hours from local preference hiring<sup>7</sup>.
- Aspiration targets of 14% of contractor hour worked by female workers and 20% of contractor hours worked by minorities

---

<sup>7</sup> ODOT applied to the Federal Highway Administration to participate in a pilot program that allows for local hiring preference. The program helps states, local communities, and the construction industry by allowing contracting agencies to use hiring preferences and/or innovative contracting approaches not otherwise authorized by law.

### *Implementation: Successes and Challenges*

The Diversity and Workforce dashboard is continuously updated to communicate the Project's status on DBE commitments. Furthermore, ODOT established a process to resolve barriers to meeting DBE commitments.

## 3 Discussion

In February 2023, EMAC met to discuss initial thoughts and ideas on creating an equitable process to sustain long-term accountability between ODOT and equity communities. Key themes discussed included:

- Equitable engagement. An accountability system should include Southwest Washington communities, low-income communities, transit users, people without access to technology and currently excluded and underserved communities.
- Transparency. ODOT should establish a feedback loop process where they are continuously communicating progress on commitments and communities are actively contributing to decision-making.
- Performance metrics and evaluation processes.
- Long-term oversight body to continuously monitor measurable impacts.
- Resolving barriers to commitments.

Several of the case studies incorporated equitable engagement and transparency as foundational components of their accountability structures. The IBR project has a robust community engagement process documented and communicated to the public through an online Accountability Dashboard. This IBR Accountability Dashboard not only presents information on the project's community engagement efforts but also captures community input and communicates how the IBR project incorporates public input in the project process.

In addition to incorporating equitable engagement and transparency in its accountability structure, the City of Seattle is also working to implement internal and external oversight systems to monitor and address equity issues continuously. The City has built internal capacity within the Seattle City government and is currently working to establish a long-term advisory board to ensure sustained commitment to creating equitable outcomes. Similar to the IBR Project, the City of Seattle developed a publicly available Racial Equity Actions database. The robust database provides community members with detailed information on City projects focusing on equity. However, unlike the IBR Accountability Dashboard, there are no established processes to capture and implement community input. Also, although the Racial Equity Actions dashboard presents information on how project outcomes will be measured and monitored, it does not report how each project is performing against its desired outcomes.

WSDOT's robust reporting processes similarly enhance transparency while tracking progress on performance metrics from multiple disciplines. Relevant to the Oregon Toll Program, WSDOT reports on Toll Division finances, operations, and customer communication systems. Although WSDOT does not currently report on Toll Division equity metrics or progress towards internal and external DEI goals, the



agency's existing reporting structures establish a pattern and precedent for future equity performance measurement.

The Project team also reviewed Prosper Portland and the I-205 Improvements Project, two projects that developed online publicly accessible accountability dashboards to report progress on meeting DBE goals for construction and contracting investments. The dashboards incorporate transparency, performance metrics, and evaluation processes as foundational to accountability structures. Both projects successfully track performance against various DBE requirements and have procedures to resolve issues.

In short, the case studies research showed that the following strategies contributed to developing equitable processes to sustain long-term accountability between agencies and communities:

- Commitment to continuous equitable engagement
- Prevalence of transparency and “information out”
- Determining how to monitor and communicate progress (or lack of progress) effectively and accurately
- Online Accountability Dashboards that illustrate metrics directly tied to the project or program’s goals and desired outcomes
- Establishing internal and external oversight bodies contribute to successful long-term performance tracking and community engagement
- Developing strategies for resolution early in the process before performance tracking

## 4 Attachments

- Case Studies Matrix



Attachment A: Case Studies Matrix

Project*	High-level summary of project, process or program	High-level summary of the project's desired outcomes/equity recommendations	How are equity metrics/outcomes tracked and communicated to the community?			Implementation Challenges
			Before the Project is completed	During construction	Long-term	Summarize implementation challenges
<b>I-5 Bridge Replacement Program (IBR)</b>	Voluntary transparency tool that provides quarterly updates on IBR community engagement	Program development will center on equity and follow a transparent, data-driven process that includes collaboration with local, state, federal and tribal partners.	Three dashboard categories: - Listening (tracks quantitative engagement metrics) - Learning (tracks changes to the project) - Reporting (links to legislative progress reports)	N/A	N/A	Multiple jurisdictions and agencies - State of Washington, State of Oregon, City of Portland, City of Vancouver, Army Corps of Engineers, etc.
San Diego Works	Three new programs/processes: 1. Open Data Portal 2. Strategic Plan Dashboard 3. Get it Done program	Citywide shift to improving transparency after turbulent period of low public trust.	Ongoing effort - no completion date.	N/A	Ongoing effort - no completion date	This effort was introduced by the former mayor of San Diego, who was in office from 2014-2020. The new programs have been popular with city residents and are still in place with the new mayor.
<b>City of Seattle Race and Social Justice Initiative/Race Forward Toolkit</b>	The Race and Social Justice Initiative (RSJI) is a citywide effort to end institutionalized racism and race-based disparities in the City of Seattle government. The RSJI Strategy Team is a division of the Seattle Office for Civil Rights (SOCR).	1. Embed racial equity in City of Seattle policies and processes 2. Centre racial justice, belonging, and wellbeing 3. Align with community organizing 4. Collaborate with regional and national racial justice leaders	Use of Racial Equity Impact Assessments (REIA) systematic examination of how different racial and ethnic groups will be affected by a proposed action or decision.	City Racial Equity Actions tracker	Citywide initiative to improve transparency around actions being taken to improve racial equity  The tracker is kept updated with projects which can be filtered by year of implementation/ completion. Project specific communication is not reported within the overall platform. Reporting on racial equity actions is done by each city department through their racial equity action plans, progress reports, or impact assessments	Major implementation challenge: tracking multiple equity efforts to ensure that there is coordination between different City departments/project teams

Attachment A: Case Studies Matrix

Project*	High-level summary of project, process or program	High-level summary of the project's desired outcomes/equity recommendations	How are equity metrics/outcomes tracked and communicated to the community?			Implementation Challenges
			Before the Project is completed	During construction	Long-term	Summarize implementation challenges
San Mateo County - US 101 Express Lanes Equity Study	The San Mateo County Express Lanes Joint Powers Authority (SMCEL-JPA) conducted an Equity Study to learn more about potential mobility improvements the San Mateo 101 Express Lane project could help address in these communities. The Equity Study build off the work conducted through the US-101 Mobility Action Plan, took next steps of evaluating equity options and strategy's, including a pilot equity program.	<p>Vision: The Pilot Equity Program (PEP) will be responsive to the transportation needs of historically underserved communities in San Mateo County and provide meaningful benefits to those communities.</p> <p>Summary of Desired Outcomes</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Pilot Equity Program should be flexibility and adapt to changing needs and community feedback over time</li> <li>2. most beneficial to underserved communities who live near lanes or likely to utilize the express lanes</li> <li>3. ensure communities who have had historically low involvement</li> <li>4. Replicability - potentially apply to other Express lane projects</li> <li>5. Safety and connectivity of active transportation network.</li> </ol>	<p>The project team developed four Equity Program Alternatives based on the outreach phase 1. These alternatives were then vetted through a technical evaluation (Equity Policy Evaluation Tool) as well as a second phase of engagement.</p> <p>Tool evaluated - (1) traffic operations (2) travel costs (3) place-based impacts</p> <p>The second round of community engagement included four streams of outreach - 17 community meetings, interviews with low-income individuals and CBOs (10 total), one virtual public meeting and an Equity Study Advisory Committee workshop.</p>	N/A	<p>SMCEL-JPA committed to provided \$1M in the first year and \$600,000 annually thereafter.</p> <p>2. SMCEL-JPA should develop a Strategic Investment Plan to identify and prioritize mobility investments for vulnerable communities beyond what the can be currently funded through the Pilot Equity Program.</p> <p>3. Establish a long term Equity Program Advisory Committee to provide guidance and feedback on program implementation and evaluation.</p> <p>Note: Study did not establish specific performance metrics to evaluate program implementation.</p>	<p>Note the Equity Study did not implemented the Equity Program but listed the following as potential implementation challenges to consider.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. heavy admin costs</li> <li>2. eligibility and enrollment mechanism, further coordination with MTC is needed</li> <li>3. Number of people served is limited by funding</li> </ol>
Proper Portland - Business Equity Program	<p>Proper Portland adopted the Construction Business &amp; Workforce Equity Policy (CBWE Policy) on April 14, 2021 to ensure construction and contracting investments provided equitable opportunities for underrepresented populations on agency-funded projects.</p> <p>The CBWE Policy establishes two different programs: (1) the Workforce Training and Hiring Program; and (2) the Business Equity Program (BEP)</p>	<p>Program identifies specific requirements that contractors, developers, borrowers, grantees, purchasers, or other parties with whom Proper Portland does business with must comply with BEP.</p> <p>Goal of the BEP is to improve outcomes for local small businesses and support the growth of construction and development firms owned by people of color and women by provided opportunities for State of Oregon Certified Firms.</p>	<p>The BEP's goals for the utilization of Certified Firms are as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. 22% of the Project's Hard Construction Costs are allocated to any combination of DBE and/or MBE firms.</li> <li>2. 20% of the Projects professional services costs allocated to Certified Firms</li> </ol> <p>Data is presented online for projects where Proposer Portland's BEP policy applies. For projects that are under construction, data is updated quarterly to reflect project progress. It shows the status of each Project and Cleary conveys whether the Project is meeting its goals per category.</p>	<p>Data is presented in the dashboard if the Project was completed within the last three years.</p>	Unclear.	

## Attachment A: Case Studies Matrix

Project*	High-level summary of project, process or program	High-level summary of the project's desired outcomes/equity recommendations	How are equity metrics/outcomes tracked and communicated to the community?			Implementation Challenges
			Before the Project is completed	During construction	Long-term	Summarize implementation challenges
Washington State Department of Transportation's Toll Division Annual Report for fiscal year (FY) 2022 (July 1, 2021 - June 30, 2022)	Annual report to share information on the Toll Division and its ongoing operations. Included in the report are express toll lane performance metrics including traffic volumes and transit use specific to the express lanes.	Transparency - One document to share with the public on information on WSDOT's Toll Division and ongoing operations	N/A - this is a reporting tool to share progress of metrics after the programs were implemented.		FY 22 - Total trips (millions) FY22 - Cost to collect toll per transaction Update on WSDOT's Good To Go! Program aimed at addressing customer issues (not equity focused) Update on business plan and websites and then specific stats on revenue, operations, maintenance, average weekday trips and Good to Go! rate per project.	N/A
I-205 Construction Diversity and Workforce Dashboard	Dashboard tracking progress towards construction workforce and contractor delivery goals.	The Diversity and Workforce dashboard was developed to show the I-205 Improvement's Project's progress toward construction workforce and contractor diversity goals for the first phase of construction. It's updated monthly.	The following I-205 Improvements Project construction workforce and contractor diversity goals were developed and approved by DDOT prior to construction. The dashboard is updated monthly. <b>Goals</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 14% of total construction contract dollars paid to date certified DBE's by completion</li> <li>• Monthly apprenticeship and on-the-job trainee (OJT) hours by trade. 20% of workforce hours for all non-operating engineer apprentice able trades and crafts. 15% of workforce hours of operating engineers</li> <li>• 5% of Tribal Employment Rights Office (TERO) referred workers</li> <li>• 8% of contract workforce hours from local preference hiring.</li> <li>• Aspiration targets of 14% of contractor hour worked by female workers and 20% of contractor hours worked by minorities</li> </ul>		N/A	N/A

Project*	High-level summary of project, process or program	High-level summary of the project's desired outcomes/equity recommendations	How are equity metrics/outcomes tracked and communicated to the community?			Implementation Challenges
			Before the Project is completed	During construction	Long-term	Summarize implementation challenges
Citizen's Assembly in Paris	Permanent Paris citizen's assembly in connection to the Paris council. Comprised of 100 residents of Paris selected by civic lottery above the age of 16.	Assembly members can (1) draft legislation that goes directly to the City Council, (2) pose questions and request evaluation of existing policies, (3) direct the creation of ad-hoc, topic-specific Citizens' Juries, and (4) set the theme for the following year's Participatory Budgeting process.	N/A	N/A	On October 14, 2021, the Paris council voted to adopt internal regulation that institutionalizes a full-scale model of representative public deliberation. There were significant efforts to ensure that the proposal was aligned with institutional and social context of the City, and that all parties were part of the conversation in its design to ensure longevity.	Large size of 100 members, potential for unequal dynamics to emerge among assembly members.
Bogotá Itinerant Citizens' Assembly (ICA)	The Bogotá Itinerant citizen's assembly (ICA) is an interconnected series of deliberative bodies that is attached to the city council. The ICA involves multiple citizen's assemblies (called "chapters") occurring sequentially with different functions, at different stages of the policy cycle. Limited information available online. Assembly has not been developed. Source - 2021 OECD report.	Inserting a standing lottery-selected bodies throughout the policy cycle, largely so that they can provide more oversight and evaluation than just delivering one-off recommendations. The goal is to give everyday people other roles to play in public decision making beyond providing recommendations on a specific policy issue.	N/A	N/A	In 2020, the Bogota city council, through its public innovation lab DEMOLAB launched a sequenced representative public deliberation through the itinerant citizen's assembly (ICA).	N/A - The Citizen's Assembly has not been implemented.

\*Bolted projects are those that are summarized in the Accountability Case Studies Memo.