



Smoke Management Advisory Committee

June 28, 2023, Meeting Summary

477.552 Policy. It is the policy of the State of Oregon:

- (1) To improve the management of prescribed burning as a forest management and protection practice.
 And
 (2) To minimize emissions from prescribed burning consistent with the air quality objectives of the Federal Clean Air Act and the State of Oregon Clean Air Act Implementation Plan developed by the Department of Environmental Quality under ORS 468A.035 [1989 c. 920 S 2]

I. Agenda

Time	Agenda Item
9:00 – 9:15 a.m. (15 mins)	Welcome and Roll Call <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome • SMAC Purpose Statement • Roll Call
9:15 – 10:15 a.m. (60 mins)	Committee Agency Reports <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ODF Reports • DEQ Reports • Committee Member Reports • Other Reports
10:15 – 10:25 p.m. (10 mins)	Public Comment
10:25 – 10:35 a.m.	Break
10:35 – 11:05 (30 min)	Smoke Management Unit FY24 Budget- Fund Balance Attached <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Revenues • Expenses • Opportunities for investment
11:05 – 12:00 (55 mins)	Metrics Performance Measures-Attached
12:00- 1:00	Lunch Break- Catered by Little Lois
1:00- 1:30 (30 mins)	Spring Burning Overview
1:30 – 2:00 (30 mins)	Smoke Management Rule Effectiveness
2:00-2:45 (45 mins)	Wildfire Crisis Implementation Strategy <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Updates • Air Curtain Incinerators ACIs • Mastication
2:45 -3:00 (15 mins)	Action Item Review/Next Meeting
3:00	Adjourn

II. Participant Attendance List

Organization	SMAC Member	Attended	SMAC Alternate	Attended
SMAC Committee Member, Chair	Gregory McClarren	Absent		
SMAC Committee Member	Scott Hanson	In person		
SMAC Committee Member	Rick Graw	Virtually		
SMAC Committee Member	Kyle Williams	In Person		
SMAC Committee Member	James Dickinson	Virtually		
ODF - Facilitator	Tim Holschbach	In Person		
ODF			Shelby Berry	Virtual
DEQ			Margaret Miller	Virtual
ODF			Ryan Miller	Virtual
ODF			Nick Yonker	Virtual
ODF			Christina Clemons	In-Person
OHA			Gabriela Goldfarb	Virtual
BLM			James Dickinson	Virtual
ODF			Pete Parsons	Virtual
ODF			Gary Votaw	Virtual
ODF			Sherri Pugh	Virtual
EPA			Erin McTique	Virtual
			Kelley Morehouse	Virtual
			Eric Kranzush	Virtual
			Jordan Perry	Virtual
			AE Godfre	Virtual

III. Action Items

- Annual report to be sent out and posted online.
- Metrics document summary to be compiled into a one-pager, posted and shared.
- Tim Holschbach will work with Rick and other Committee members to make cost and projection for revenues more informative in order to move forward in a better manner.
- Rick Graw requested there be a narrative for prescribed fire effects on wildland smoke. Metric addition to be updated and finalized.
- Rick Graw requested improving forecasting for overnight drainage flow to be moved to the county level for Deschutes. Tim stated that this will be integrated into the West Bend conversations that are ongoing. Margaret Miller requested there be an additional conversation for public health awareness.
- Next Meeting- Due to a conflict of schedules the next meeting date will be sent out at a later date. Estimate of next meeting to be held possibly in mid-January.
- Prior 01/26/2023 meeting Summary attached.

IV. Meeting Chat

- 09:06:41 From Tim Holschbach: All, we will start at 915.
- 09:07:01 From Erin McTigue, US EPA: Reacted to "All, we will start a..." with 👍
- 09:18:32 From Erin McTigue, US EPA: Little echo happening.
- 09:18:37 From Erin McTigue, US EPA: Maybe two mics on?
- 09:20:02 From gsvotaw: Tim. You're muted?
- 09:20:41 From Erin McTigue, US EPA: I can hear rick.
- 09:20:43 From Margaret Miller: It is coming through to me.
- 09:20:53 From SBERRY: I can hear Rick.
- 09:21:14 From gsvotaw: Going to reboot. See if that fixes it.
- 09:48:26 From Rick Graw: Could ODF respond to Gabriella's comment on mapping of planned and current Rx burns?
- 09:51:29 From Margaret Miller: Reacted to "Could ODF respond to..." with 👍
- 10:12:07 From Gabriela Goldfarb, OR Health Authority (she/her): James, I was very USFS-centric; should be referencing USFS+BLM!
- 10:14:41 From James Dickinson: Gabriela - no worries.
- 10:16:38 From Gabriela Goldfarb, OR Health Authority (she/her): Thanks all, signing off!
- 10:34:56 From Rick Graw: Why does the spreadsheet show BLM's account as all zero every quarter?
- 11:02:32 From Christina Clemons: Great comment on the emissions vs acres James
- 11:10:58 From Kelley Morehouse: Thank you for the open meeting, it has been helpful to me as a community member sitting in today. I am a volunteer working with the Silverton Community, requesting the city to develop a task force for a Wildfire Resiliency Plan. (Or community response plan). I am concerned about smoke risks from bad air quality and the need for education in the community to lessen health risks and other preparation as a community.
- 11:11:12 From Tim Holschbach to Kelley Morehouse (Direct Message): Thank you for joining.
- 11:11:50 From Margaret Miller: Reacted to "Thank you for the op..." with 👍
- 11:12:29 From Margaret Miller: Hi Kelly it is nice to e-meet you. Feel free to reach out to me at Margaret.miller@deq.oregon.gov. I'm happy to provide support where possible.
- 11:15:23 From Christina Clemons: Same Kelley. I enjoy teaching private landowners how to estimate their fuel-loading and ways to burn without smoking out cities. So, if you need someone to do a kind of field day workshop. Hit me up at Christina.t.clemons@odf.oregon.gov

11:15:37 From Margaret Miller: Reacted to "Same Kelley. I enjoy..." with ❤️🔥

11:43:02 From Rick Graw: Ryan and Tim, take a look at the map I presented at the last SMAC meeting which illustrated all the communities which have had smoke intrusions and the associated Rx burn locations.

11:43:37 From Tim Holschbach: Thanks Rick

11:46:33 From Rick Graw: Perhaps we ought to focus on the high priority areas at risk from wildfire based upon the state fire risk maps as to where we need to relax the AQ rules for Rx burning while increasing community resilience to smoke.

13:01:32 From Margaret Miller: I'm getting some funny feedback when Gary is on.

13:31:58 From Margaret Miller: Tim your comments sheds light on how important the RX burn map and other communication tools are.

13:32:28 From Tim Holschbach: That's why public health was at that meeting in Bend when the discussion was taking place.

13:47:00 From Margaret Miller:
<https://acrobat.adobe.com/link/track?uri=urn:aaid:scds:US:68669caa-ce6e-428c-94c4-2eb488947c32>

14:07:20 From James Dickinson: At the management level, we are doing a poor job of separating out the different parts of risk. Hazard & vulnerability ... Margaret is right - we don't always need to deal with the fuels in a community. In an ecosystem management viewpoint: the product of Hazard and vulnerability equal a different type of risk.

14:10:57 From James Dickinson: *clarification - "we don't always need to deal with the rearranged fuels using fire in a community - recognizing that if it does ignite it will be a dirty, messy, smokey mess -- but the risk is reduced- which is the specific goal."

14:12:52 From Margaret Miller: Reacted to "At the management le..." with 👍

14:12:58 From Margaret Miller: Reacted to "*clarification - "we..." with 👍

14:13:54 From Margaret Miller: I really want to see the larger ACIs used in logging operations. We met with Weyhauser about this topic.

14:32:55 From Margaret Miller: Mag will help Tim with rule making, AQ forecasting, etc.

14:33:02 From Margaret Miller: Tim = ODF



OREGON DEPARTMENT OF FORESTRY
SMOKE MANAGEMENT FUND 6500 SUMMARY FUND STATUS
AS OF MAY 2023 MONTH END CLOSE

Calendar Year	Calendar Mo/Yr	USFS Burn Fee Revenue/Federal	BLM Burn Fee Revenue/Federal	Non-Federal Burn Fee Revenue	Other Revenue	Total Revenue	Expenditures	Fund Balance	Fund Balance w/o error (\$127,183.90)
2021	Oct-21	152,489.90	0.00	102,190.20	37,500.00	292,180.10	40,078.19	933,882.37	806,698.47
2021	Nov-21	0.00	0.00	49,465.60	0.00	49,465.60	45,123.70	938,224.27	811,040.37
2021	Dec-21	0.00	0.00	7,454.00	0.00	7,454.00	51,164.26	894,514.01	767,330.11
2021	CY Total	340,503.90	0.00	208,246.90	52,500.00	601,250.80	541,598.97		
2022	Jan-22	17,463.10	0.00	-956.90	15,000.00	31,506.20	46,961.53	879,058.68	751,874.78
2022	Feb-22	0.00	0.00	4,611.90	0.00	4,611.90	29,137.43	854,533.15	727,349.25
2022	Mar-22	89.00	0.00	1,689.60	0.00	1,778.60	46,606.03	809,705.72	682,521.82
2022	Apr-22	15,519.80	0.00	837.00	0.00	16,356.80	42,838.12	783,224.40	656,040.50
2022	May-22	0.00	0.00	19.80	0.00	19.80	40,296.75	742,947.45	615,763.55
2022	Jun-22	42,507.10	0.00	-265.30	0.00	42,241.80	39,311.53	745,877.72	618,693.82
2022	Jul-22	0.00	0.00	-1,296.10	0.00	-1,296.10	37,469.34	707,112.28	579,928.38
2022	Aug-22	0.00	0.00	99.20	0.00	99.20	42,023.42	665,188.06	538,004.16
2022	Sep-22	1,029.20	0.00	1,595.00	0.00	2,624.20	68,824.38	598,987.88	471,803.98
2022	Oct-22	22,321.30	0.00	26,236.27	0.00	48,557.57	39,804.02	607,741.43	480,557.53
2022	Nov-22	0.00	0.00	227.13	39,000.00	39,227.13	58,076.97	588,891.59	461,707.69
2022	Dec-22	34,817.90	0.00	138,526.40	0.00	173,344.30	54,916.36	707,319.53	580,135.63
2022	CY Total	133,747.40	0.00	171,324.00	54,000.00	359,071.40	546,265.88		
2023	Jan-23	4,179.90	0.00	68.70	15,000.00	19,248.60	59,624.88	666,943.25	539,759.35
2023	Feb-23	-639.70	0.00	13,617.50	0.00	12,977.80	65,210.98	614,710.07	487,526.17
2023	Mar-23	-118,161.10	0.00	1,172.55	0.00	-116,988.55	49,121.44	448,600.08	
2023	Apr-23	181.20	0.00	88.30	0.00	269.50	61,573.26	387,296.32	
2023	May-23	0.00	0.00	-8,140.70	0.00	-8,140.70	47,807.09	331,348.53	
2023	CY Total	-114,439.70	0.00	6,806.35	15,000.00	-92,633.35	283,337.65		

Oregon’s Smoke Management - Performance Measures

Background:

The Oregon Smoke Management Plan (SMP) was developed as a voluntary program in 1969 and adopted as a regulatory program by the State Forester and the Environmental Quality Commission (EQC) in 1972. In 1989, a five-member advisory committee was created and is referred to as the Smoke Management Advisory Committee (SMAC). The SMP is multifaceted and can influence other state goals such as public health, air quality, economics, forest health, and wildfire risk. The SMP has gone through several major revisions since then. The last revision to the SMP plan was completed in early 2019.

This document outlines the Oregon SMP Performance Measures, which will be used to gauge the programmatic success and opportunities. These performance measures were developed in collaboration with the Oregon Smoke Management Advisory Committee, the Oregon Department of Forestry, and the Oregon Department of Environmental Quality.

See *Appendix A - Developing SMP Performance Measures* for more information on SMART metrics.

Acronyms:

AAR = After Action Reviews	OHA = Oregon Health Authority
ACI = Air Curtain Incinerator	PE = Polyethylene
CRP = Community Response Plan	RH = Regional Haze
DEQ = Department of Environmental Quality	SCF = Statewide Communication Framework
ERT = Emissions Reduction Techniques	SIP = State Implementation Plan
KPI = Key Performance Indicators	SMART = Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Relevant, and Time-bound
NAAQS = National Ambient Air Quality Standards	WWNF = Wallowa Whitman National Forest
NEI= National Emissions Inventory	
ODF = Oregon Department of Forestry	

Definitions:

Alternatives to burning: as defined in OAR 629-048-0005(1)

Emission reduction techniques: as defined in OAR 629-048-0005(11)

Prescribed burning: as defined in OAR 629-048-0005(23)

Smoke intrusions: as defined in OAR 629-048-0005(27)

Smoke incidents: as defined in OAR 629-048-0005(28)

NAAQs exceedances: As of 2020, the EPA has primary and secondary standards for PM2.5. Primary standards provide public health protection, including protecting the health of "sensitive" populations such as asthmatics, children, and the elderly. Secondary standards provide public welfare protection, including protection against decreased visibility and damage to animals, crops, vegetation, and buildings. EPA must review and potentially revise the NAAQS every five years. Below is a table for the NAAQS standards as of September 3, 2020:

Primary/Secondary	Averaging Time	Level	Form
Primary	1 year	12.0 µg/m ³	annual mean, averaged over 3 years
Secondary	1 year	15.0 µg/m ³	annual mean, averaged over 3 years
Primary and Secondary	24 hours	35 µg/m ³	98th percentile, averaged over 3 years

The principal goals of the Smoke Management Plan are identified in OAR 629-048-0010(4), which are as follows:

- a) Minimize smoke emissions resulting from prescribed burning as described by ORS 477.552; on forestlands from being carried to or accumulating in SSRAs or other areas sensitive to smoke, and to provide maximum opportunity for essential forestland burning while minimizing emissions;
- b) Provide maximum opportunity for essential forestland burning;
- c) Protect public health by avoiding intrusions;
- d) Coordinate with other state smoke management programs;
- e) Comply with state and federal air quality and visibility requirements; and
- f) Promote further development of techniques to minimize or reduce emissions by encouraging cost-effective utilization of forestland biomass, alternatives to burning and alternative burning practices emission reduction techniques.

Measuring Programmatic Success:

The status of the SMP performance metrics will be documented in an annual report and presented to the SMAC.

The report will be based on audits of a minimum of 1% of prescribed burns conducted over the reporting period. Information in the report will include evaluation of the effectiveness of the Smoke Management Performance Metrics. See *Appendix B* for details on the smoke management annual report.

Performance Measures:

1) Minimize smoke emissions, resulting from prescribed burning:

Goal:	Minimize smoke emissions, resulting from prescribed burning
Objective:	Demonstrate an increasing trend in utilizing emission reduction techniques and a decreasing trend in smoke emissions per ton, resulting from prescribed burning, over the course of 12 years (4 NEI cycles). ¹
Deliverable(s):	Encourage the use of emission reduction techniques (ERT) by hosting a minimum of one annual training course on emission reduction of prescribed burning.
	Improve emission reduction evaluation by asking whether PE coverings will be used when a burn unit is registered and to confirm the use of PE coverings at accomplishment reporting. ²
	ODF will document where alternatives to burning or emission reduction techniques have led to an increase in tonnage burned.
	Prior to the Smoke Management Program rule review, ODF/DEQ will review all known, available, and emerging ERT techniques and compare with other states' ERTs to ensure the best available techniques are used and promoted.
Metrics/KPI(s):	number of trainings held, number of training attendees, smoke emissions by burn type, burner survey, tons burned using ERTs
Outcome(s):	Oregonians breathe cleaner air during prescribed burns

¹ This will not necessarily take into consideration the fuel loads and emissions by type of prescribed burn. In addition, we are currently only using the NEI general emissions calculation.

² PE covering parameters – 75% piles covered and 60% coverage per pile.

³ SSRA with 1-hr exemptions will not be held to the 70ug/m3 threshold.

2) Provide maximum opportunity for essential forestland burning:

Goal:	Provide maximum opportunity for essential forestland burning.
Objective:	Demonstrate an increasing trend in essential forestland burning acres, without an increase in smoke intrusions, over the course of 12 years (4 NEI cycles).
Deliverable(s):	Host one After Action Review (AAR) for all smoke impacts that exceed the NAAQs 35 ug/m3 within 45 days of the occurrence.
	Incentivize the use of ERTs, by offering a 50% increase in tonnage for burn units using ERTs vs. those burn units not using ERTs.
Metrics/KPI(s):	number of ignitions, and number of acres accomplished, increase of tons burned by utilizing ERTs, timeliness of AAR, optimal/opportunity burn days
Outcome(s):	Wildfire hazardous risk mitigation, healthier forests, improved forest productivity, less impacts to communities from smoke from wildfires.

3) Protect public health by avoiding intrusions:

Goal:	Protect public health by avoiding intrusions and building smoke resilient communities
Objective(s):	Demonstrate a decreasing trend in smoke intrusions and an increasing trend in coordination, development, and implementation of Community Response Plans.
Deliverable(s):	Protect public health by having zero smoke impacts that exceed the 24-hour PM2.5 threshold of 26 ug/m3 and 1-hour PM2.5 threshold of 70 ug/m3. ³
	Promote collaboration between local and tribal public health authorities, vulnerable populations, vegetation/fuel managers, and prescribed burners by assisting in the development of at least one new CRP annually.
	DEQ will enhance the quality of Oregon’s air quality monitoring network by the addition of 20 new lower cost SensORs across Oregon by 2026.
	OHA attends all SMAC meetings to provide public health advice and input.
	DEQ, ODF, and OHA evaluate intrusion report/AAR includes CRP efficacy where applicable.
Metrics/KPI(s):	Number of new CRPs, total number of CRPs, decrease in the number of smoke intrusions by location
Outcome(s):	Oregonians breathe cleaner air during prescribed burns

4) Increase cross agency collaboration and coordination with other state smoke management programs:

Goal:	Strengthen cross agency collaboration and coordination with other state smoke management programs
--------------	---

¹ This will not necessarily take into consideration the fuel loads and emissions by type of prescribed burn. In addition, we are currently only using the NEI general emissions calculation.

² PE covering parameters – 75% piles covered and 60% coverage per pile.

³ SSRA with 1-hr exemptions will not be held to the 70ug/m3 threshold.

Objective:	Participate in interagency, regional, and nationwide forums to promote Oregon’s Smoke Management Plan.
Deliverable(s):	ODF/DEQ/OHA will promote collaboration between local and tribal public health authorities, vulnerable populations, vegetation/fuel managers, and prescribed burners by assisting in the development of at least one new CRP annually.
	ODF, DEQ, and OHA meet as needed to discuss the implementation of the MOU and any additional collaboration needs.
	Attend the Regional EPA meeting, “Smoke Management in the NW”
	Attending relevant interagency, regional, and nationwide forums as capacity allows.
	Evaluate how the SMP is affecting other state goals such as public health, air quality, timber economy, forest health, and fire risk.
Metrics/KPI(s):	Attendance in interagency, regional, and nationwide meetings
Outcome(s):	Build partnerships, identify barriers and opportunities for better smoke management across state boundaries, utilizing lessons learned from other entities.

5) Comply with state and federal air quality and visibility requirements:

Goal:	Comply with state and federal air quality and visibility requirements
Objective:	Comply with state and federal air and visibility standards by having zero smoke impacts that exceeds the NAAQs 24-hour PM2.5 thresholds.
Deliverable(s):	Every 5 years, DEQ will provide updates on NAAQS compliance as it pertains to smoke management.
	ODF will track the number of exceedances in which smoke from prescribed burns caused or contributed to a NAAQS exceedance.
	ODF will coordinate with DEQ Regional Haze program to determine prescribed fire smoke visibility impacts to Class 1 areas.
Metrics/KPI(s):	NAAQs compliance rate
Outcome(s):	Oregonians breathe cleaner air during prescribed burning, increased recreation, improved views, increased recreation, positive public perception

6) Increase smoke management communication at the local level and across stakeholders.

Goal:	Continuously increasing social license and the development of positive public perception of prescribed fire
Objective:	Increase smoke management understanding and communication across stakeholders.
Deliverable(s):	ODF will maintain smoke communications efforts, by updating and distributing the Statewide Communication Framework (SCF) to stakeholders annually.

¹ This will not necessarily take into consideration the fuel loads and emissions by type of prescribed burn. In addition, we are currently only using the NEI general emissions calculation.

² PE covering parameters – 75% piles covered and 60% coverage per pile.

³ SSRA with 1-hr exemptions will not be held to the 70ug/m3 threshold.

	Promote collaboration between local and tribal public health authorities, vulnerable populations, vegetation/fuel managers, and prescribed burners by assisting in the development of at least one new CRP annually.
	Promote collaboration by assisting in regional engagement related to SM/RX burning in Oregon.
Metrics/KPI(s):	Technical assistance provided to communities. Public outreach and information events.
Outcome(s):	Positive public perception

These future deliverables have been identified and may be integrated into the SMP metrics as the program matures.

Future Deliverable(s):	Demonstrate a decreasing trend in unauthorized smoke emissions, resulting from non-compliant prescribed burning, over the course of 12 years (4 NEI cycles).
	DEQ will complete a comprehensive review of open burning opportunities and barriers related to slash (silvicultural) burning in areas outside of the forest protection districts.
	DEQ will improve monitoring effectiveness of the program by updating the AQM system to include notifications of (define triggers/threshold) to staff at DEQ & ODF.
	Identify the correct agency to complete an analysis to better understand the impacts of wildfire smoke on visibility vs. prescribed burning impacts.
	DEQ will measure main plume smoke impacts in class 1 visibility areas.
	Track number of hours burned annually.
	Improve public communications, by updating the Smoke Management Data System to allow access and querying capability to those outside of ODF.
	Analyze impacts of prescribed fire treatments on wildfire smoke emissions and impacts/severity.

Appendix A. Developing SMP Performance Measures

Goal:	
Objective:	
Deliverable(s):	
Metrics/KPI(s):	
Outcome(s):	

Goals: Broad, lofty ideas, which are intangible, abstract, and may not be measurable; long term.

Outcomes: Benefit obtained from achieving a goal.

¹ This will not necessarily take into consideration the fuel loads and emissions by type of prescribed burn. In addition, we are currently only using the NEI general emissions calculation.

² PE covering parameters – 75% piles covered and 60% coverage per pile.

³ SSRA with 1-hr exemptions will not be held to the 70ug/m3 threshold.

Objectives: Objectives makes a goal specific, measurable, and time bound; often expressed in the form: “To [improve/increase/enhance/etc.] something, by [x amount], by [dd/mm/yy date].”

- Objectives should be “SMART” S.M.A.R.T. = Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Relevant, Time-bound. If you can track achievement against the objective on a graph, then it is a SMART objective.

Deliverables: Defined “outputs” that (may) achieve an objective.

Key performance indicators (KPIs): Specific metrics which are used to track performance to make sure you are on track to meet specific objectives.

Metrics: A system or standard of measurement.

Metric Examples

Volume	Input volume, Output volume (yield), Quantity of..., Frequency & Usage rates (No./Day)
Time	Activity processing time (Duration), Cycle-time (end-to-end), Delay (waiting time)
Cost	People cost (from time & overhead), Resource costs (non-people), Profit/Loss, Value-add
Success Rate	Accuracy, Error Rate, Response Rate, Completion Rate, Non-compliances, compliance rate
Conformance %	Achievement of specification, Completeness, Availability
Timeliness	On-time ..., No. or % delivered late, No. or % of ...
Perception	Satisfaction, Happiness, % Agreement/Disagreement, etc.
Physical Parameters	Length, Weight/Mass, Volume, Area, Time, energy, etc.

Appendix B. Smoke Management Annual Report

To date, the annual report has been the mechanism, which ODF has used to demonstrate that it is meeting the objectives of the SMP.

Currently included in the annual report:

- Track number of intrusions, incidents, and NAAQs exceedances each year.
- Track smoke emissions resulting from prescribed fire (broken down by type of burn).
- Track number of exceedances in which smoke from prescribed burns caused or contributed to a NAAQS exceedance.
- Report on total quantity of material combusted annually by prescribed burns.
- Track these measures on sub geographic levels (districts).
- Measure intrusions per units burned.

Optional reporting parameters that could be included on future annual reports (these are in no order just how they appeared in comments)

- Polyethylene usage covering prescribed burn piles.
- OHA tracks public health impacts from smoke from Rx burning and ODF includes it as an appendix to the annual report.
- Identify if ERTs are being used with each burn. Identify if there are opportunities to improve upon ERTs.
- Track use of alternative to burning and use of ERTs. Report on trends.
- For understory and broadcast burns, track duration of approved hours to burn for each burn approval versus acres accomplished annually.²

¹ This will not necessarily take into consideration the fuel loads and emissions by type of prescribed burn. In addition, we are currently only using the NEI general emissions calculation.

² PE covering parameters – 75% piles covered and 60% coverage per pile.

³ SSRA with 1-hr exemptions will not be held to the 70ug/m3 threshold.



Smoke Management Advisory Committee January 26, 2023, Meeting Summary

477.552 Policy. It is the policy of the State of Oregon:

- (1) To improve the management of prescribed burning as a forest management and protection practice.
And
- (2) To minimize emissions from prescribed burning consistent with the air quality objectives of the Federal Clean Air Act and the State of Oregon Clean Air Act Implementation Plan developed by the Department of Environmental Quality under ORS 468A.035 [1989 c. 920 S 2]

I. Agenda

Time	Agenda Item
9:00 – 9:15 a.m. (15 mins)	Welcome and Roll Call <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome • Roll Call • Minutes Review
9:15 – 10:15 a.m. (60 mins)	Committee Agency Reports <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ODF Report/Fund balance/Annual Report • DEQ Reports • OHA Reports • SMAC Committee Reports Written Reports Attached
10:15 – 10:25 p.m. (10 mins)	Public Comment
10:25 – 10:35 a.m.	Break
10:35 – 11:30 (55 mins)	Opportunities and threats to prescribed fire <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exemption status updates
11:30 – 12:00 (30 mins)	EPA NAAQS Discussion
12:00- 1:00	Lunch Break
1:00- 1:15 (15 mins)	2022 Burning/Intrusion/Incident Summary
1:15 – 1:30 (15 mins)	West Bend Status Update ODF, DEQ, USFS
1:30 -2:00 (30 mins)	Metrics Presentation- ODF, OHA, DEQ
2:00 -2:30 (30 mins)	Community Response Plan Development Opportunities and Challenges
2:30-3:00 (30 mins)	Action Item Review/Next Meeting
3:00	Adjourn

II. Participant Attendance List

Organization	SMAC Member	Attended	SMAC Alternate	Attended
SMAC Committee Member, Chair	Gregory McClarren	Absent		
SMAC Committee Member	Scott Hanson	In-Person		
SMAC Committee Member	Rick Graw	Virtual		
SMAC Committee Member	Kyle Williams	In-Person		
SMAC Committee Member	Jason Simmons			
ODF - Facilitator	Tim Holschbach	In-Person		
ODF			Shelby Berry	Virtual
DEQ			Margaret Miller	In-Person
DEQ			Peter Brewer	In-Person
DEQ			Jennifer Horton	In-Person
DEQ			Hillarie Sales	Virtual
DEQ			Scott Peerman	In-Person
USEPA			Erin Mctique	In-Person
OHA			Gabriela Goldfarb	Virtual
OHA			Kim Tham	
ODF			Pete Parsons	
ODF			Gary Votaw	Virtual
ODF			Sheri Pugh	Virtual
ODF			Amanda Rau	Virtual
ODF			Christina Clemons	Virtual
ODF			Mike White	Virtual
OHA			Carol Trenga	Virtual
LRAPA			Travis Knudson	Virtual
OHA			Gabriela Goldfarb	Virtual
			Gretchen Steward	Virtual
ODF			Carrie Capp	Virtual
			Matt Grimes	Virtual
			Lance Giles	Virtual
			Susan Jane Brown	Virtual

III. Action Items

- **Welcome and Roll Call-** General review of the day was given.
- **Committee Agency Reports-**
ODF Report/Fund balance/Annual Report-Tim reported out, corresponding reports attached.

DEQ Reports-Attached
OHA Reports- Attached
SMAC Committee Reports

- **Public Comment-** No public comment was given.
- **Opportunities and Threats to Prescribed Fire-** Tim Led discussion.
- **EPA NAAQ'S Discussion-** Draft a letter to send in for the NAAQ's comment with recommendations to the State Forester to review the proposed rule and how it would impact the program.
- **2022 Burning/Intrusion/Incident Summary-** Sherri Pugh provided a review of the 2022 summary.
- **West Bend Status Update-** Updates were discussed by ODF, DEQ, and USFS
- **Metrics Presentation-** Discussion led by Tim surrounding metric performance.
- **Community Response Plan Development-** Joint discussion was had regarding the community response plan development.
- **Action Item Review/Next Meeting-** June 22, 2023 placeholder set for next meeting.

IV. Meeting Chat

09:10:40 From Amanda Rau (ODF): Rules were approved by BOF in November

09:10:43 From Amanda Rau (ODF): For CBM that is

09:21:23 From Scott Peerman: SCRAP Committee

09:28:49 From Scott Peerman: It's not listed in rule as a minimum component.

09:35:28 From Tim Holschbach: Sorry for the delay

09:35:38 From Tim Holschbach: we are trying to get the zoom back up and working.

09:49:13 From Rick Graw: Can we zoom in on the video for the room so we can better see attendees?

09:50:52 From Travis Knudsen - LRAPA: I believe that question is very relevant to the 37 days of USG or above in Oakridge seen in 2022.

09:52:34 From Mike White: Great comment Kyle! That would have a much greater impact!

09:59:19 From Travis Knudsen - LRAPA: This is a great way to consider this data!

10:02:57 From Carol Trenga (OR Health Auth., she/her) to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : Hi Tim, I can share the recently published article about mental health and wildfire in Oregon that Rick was mentioning. Also, the PDF of the supplemental materials. I wasn't sure the best way to distribute and didn't want to just drop it in the chat to everyone. Thank you.

10:03:15 From Gabriela Goldfarb, OR Health Authority (she/her) : Good job on the camera Tim!

10:04:36 From Tim Holschbach to Carol Trenga (OR Health Auth., she/her) (Direct Message) : I noted when we wrap up, of asking if SMAC wants it as a presentation topic in June

10:04:54 From Tim Holschbach to Carol Trenga (OR Health Auth., she/her) (Direct Message) : But happy to distribute that for you to the committee in the interim as well

10:05:32 From Carol Trenga (OR Health Auth., she/her) to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : OK, I'll email it to you. thanks!

10:06:49 From Carol Trenga (OR Health Auth., she/her) to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : If the SMAC is interested in the mental health topic, it might be good to include a few discussants and topics (the Youth Mental Health work done by the OHA Climate Program that Gabriela mentioned come to mind).

10:07:56 From Gabriela Goldfarb, OR Health Authority (she/her): Would be interested whether the state could make a formal request to USFS to have ARAs or other appropriate folks at the table, as the example Margaret raised.

10:38:20 From Rick Graw: Tim, I would add "weather" to you list.

10:39:03 From Carol Trenga (OR Health Auth., she/her) to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : Can you drop that list in the chat?

10:41:42 From Tim Holschbach : Worforce - skills/bodies/equipment

Liability - insurance/civil/trespass/suppression

Cost - prep/burn/hold

10:43:03 From Tim Holschbach : Airshed - weather/climate/forecast

social license - rural, non-SSRA impact, NAAQS

Technology - forecasting/modeling/data collection

10:44:20 From Carol Trenga (OR Health Auth., she/her) to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : Thanks!

10:46:46 From Gabriela Goldfarb, OR Health Authority (she/her): Interesting thought about comprehensive forest and smoke resilience workforce...

10:55:47 From Rick Graw to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : Tim, would this be the right time to share that map that I sent to you?

10:57:45 From Tim Holschbach to Rick Graw (Direct Message) : Got for it, share screen at will

11:28:34 From Mike White : Communication & Education has been a top topic over the last 3 reviews

11:35:58 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10 : I'm here but not the correct person to comment. Happy to relay comments or questions to the NAAQS team.

11:37:04 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10:

<https://www.epa.gov/pm-pollution/proposed-decision-reconsideration-national-ambient-air-quality-standards-particulate>

11:37:22 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10: The maps I think you are referring to:

<https://www.epa.gov/system/files/documents/2023-01/PM%20Maps%20-%202022%20proposal%20%282%29.pdf>

11:39:42 From Susan Jane Brown: 100% - thank you for making that point!

11:40:40 From Jennifer Horton : Tim, can you show the second slide on this website?

11:41:09 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10: Thanks Margaret. And this is why EPA works with States/Tribes on Smoke Management Plans, recognizing this significant challenge.

11:41:22 From Susan Jane Brown : If we're unable to use controlled burning to mitigate wildfire risk, we will have more wildfires, which produce far more toxic smoke than controlled burns

11:47:46 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10 : Noting these concerns and ideas, Rick and all. EPA R10 absolutely recognizes the challenges and needs around Rx fire and fuels management, and we are also responsible for health standards under the CAA.

11:49:00 From Susan Jane Brown: Noted. This IS a health issue.

11:55:03 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10 : I was going to raise my hand but understand we are transitioning on here. In terms of timing, no it is not too late to be commenting on and discussing these issues. Of course, we encourage formal commenting on the proposed PM2.5 revisions when able (note that the proposals also include changes to the AQI). I'll continue to pass along what I hear in my smoke coordination role for region 10. There is a ton of work going on at EPA around smoke management, both internally and externally, including conversations about the policies around ACI permitting, etc.

11:55:26 From Rick Graw : Could you clarify if the Sens OR could be used to determine attainment?

11:55:53 From Tim Holschbach to Erin McTigue, USEPA R10(Direct Message): Thanks Erin. If you would like some response time, I can work you into the agenda at the start of the afternoon. Up to you.

11:56:43 From Scott Peerman : The SensORs are not considered a federal reference method or federal equivalency method. My understanding is that they cannot be used for that.

11:57:15 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10 to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : Thanks Tim - that's ok - appreciate it though! I have nothing groundbreaking to share but will throw a comment or two in the chat if that still works. :)

11:57:49 From Tim Holschbach to Erin McTigue, USEPA R10(Direct Message) : Copy. Im sensitive to fed bashing.

11:58:27 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10 : FYI, an assessment of Rx vs Wildfire impacts that EPA, USFS, others collaborated on in the past couple of years.
<https://cfpub.epa.gov/ncea/risk/recordisplay.cfm?deid=352824>

11:59:03 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10 to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : Thanks Tim - I'm developing a thicker skin as each day goes by. :)

12:01:25 From Travis Knudsen - LRAPA : What's the approximate cost to create, and site? are there significant maintenance costs? Are these seen as temporary or long-term sites?

12:06:18 From Tim Holschbach to Erin McTigue, USEPA R10(Direct Message) : Would the EPA be up for a planned presentation at the June SMAC meeting regarding NAAQS? I don't want to mention it if you're not interested.

12:06:24 From Travis Knudsen - LRAPA: Great thank you!

12:09:07 From Tim Holschbach : <https://ordeq.org/AQSensORSurvey>

12:10:26 From Carol Trenga (OR Health Auth., she/her) : Are both the English and Spanish language surveys open through Feb. 15th? The first email I received said it closes 2/1.

13:00:10 From Rick Graw to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : Tim, this is the best SMAC meeting I've been at yet. Thanks for your leadership!

13:01:56 From Tim Holschbach to Erin McTigue, USEPA R10(Direct Message) : Would the EPA be up for a planned presentation at the June SMAC meeting regarding NAAQS? I don't want to mention it if you're not interested.

13:02:12 From Tim Holschbach to Rick Graw(Direct Message) : Team effort, SMAC built the agenda

13:02:29 From Tim Holschbach to Rick Graw(Direct Message) : I have a running list to topics for June for consideration at close as well

13:20:08 From Rick Graw : I think sometimes we are too limiting to what the forecasters could share that would be helpful. I'm interested in much more than just the smoke intrusions.

13:20:51 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10 to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : Tim - sure - could definitely set that up. I would likely tag someone from the NAAQS team to join me.

13:21:24 From Tim Holschbach to Erin McTigue, USEPA R10(Direct Message): Sounds good. I'll mention it at the end of the meeting for developing the June agenda.

13:21:53 From Mike White: 👍 yes

13:22:08 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10 to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : perfect.

13:22:18 From Rick Graw: We're behind our schedule.

13:24:16 From Tim Holschbach to Rick Graw(Direct Message) : I think we'll be good on time overall, the CRP topic may be a bit light

13:25:32 From Rick Graw to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : Nice.

13:29:49 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10: thank you!

13:37:43 From CC to Tim Holschbach(Direct Message) : It is in the directive. I always get more than 1 % of units a year.

13:38:36 From Carrie Capp, ODF-COD Fuels & Fire Planner: NEI =?

13:38:56 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10: national emissions inventory

13:39:37 From Rick Graw : Tim, perhaps at the next SMAC meeting, we could get a rep from CALFIRE to talk about their ERT program and the use of ACIs?

13:43:23 From Carrie Capp, ODF-COD Fuels & Fire Planner : Has a definition for "essential" been established in this context?

13:52:04 From Rick Graw : ODF Forecasters are at the front line of public health protection by avoiding smoke intrusions. If there's anything the forecasters think would be mentioning, such as use of new forecast models, new internal analysis, etc. let's capture that as well.

14:05:24 From Gabriela Goldfarb, OR Health Authority (she/her) : Folks, unfortunately have a mandatory meeting I have to jump to, Carol Trenga will be staying on for OHA!

14:16:15 From CC : It might give insight to social license...

14:16:55 From Tim Holschbach to CC (Direct Message) : For the record, could I please get your name?

14:36:45 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10: thank you!

14:36:48 From Erin McTigue, USEPA R10: Congrats Peter.

14:37:29 From Amanda Rau - OSU (she/her): Thanks Peter, congrats!

14:37:32 From Scott Peerman: Thanks all!