



Grade Level: 8
Subject: ELA

Compare & Contrast Perspectives

ESSENTIAL UNDERSTANDINGS

- History
- Identity
- Lifeways

LEARNING OUTCOMES

- Using a Venn Diagram, students will be able to compare and contrast the First Ship Seen by the Clatsop and the journal entries by women on the Oregon Trail.

CULTURALLY RESPONSIVE PRACTICES

- Proximity
- Interaction with others through group work on Venn Diagram and worksheet
- Preserving and honoring cultural history
- Student talk, working together and individually
- Music

ASSESSMENT

Students will be assessed on their ability to describe the differences between Native American and settlers' perspectives using the Venn Diagram and the Compare & Contrast worksheet.

Overview

This lesson will introduce students to two different perspectives, the Native American perspective and the settler's perspective regarding their first encounters with each other.

MATERIALS

- [Compare & Contrast Worksheet](#)
- ["First Ship Seen by the Clatsop"](#)
- [Journals, Letters, and Diaries written by women on the Oregon Trail 1836-1865](#)
- [Venn Diagram](#)
- [Vocabulary](#)

LOGISTICS

- Where does this activity take place?
Classroom
- How are the students organized?

Whole Class Teams: 3-5

Pairs Individually

TIME REQUIRED

Two 50 minute periods

STANDARDS

Oregon Common Core State Standards: ELA-Literacy

6-8.RH.6 Identify aspects of a text that reveal an author's point of view or purpose (e.g., loaded language, inclusion or avoidance of particular tasks)

6-8.RH.8 Distinguish among fact, opinion, and reasoned judgment in a text

Oregon Social Sciences Academic Content Standards

Historical Knowledge 8.23 Evaluate the continuity and change over the course of United States history by analyzing the key people and events from the 1780s through Reconstruction.

Historical Knowledge 8.24 Examine the causes of westward expansion, the resulting cultural and physical genocide, and the methods of resistance, change, and adaptation, by indigenous peoples in response to the invasion of their lands.

Historical Knowledge 8.28 Critique and analyze historical events to recognize power, authority, religion, economics, and governance as they relate to systemic oppression and its impact on Indigenous peoples, ethnic and religious groups, and other historically marginalized groups in the colonial and modern era.

English Language Proficiency Standards

6-8.3 An ELL can speak and write about grade appropriate complex literary and informational texts and topics.

6-8.8 An ELL can determine the meaning of words and phrases in oral presentations and literary and informational text.

Background for Teachers

Native American Perspective: "History textbooks unfortunately tend to ignore the cooperation, friendship, and agreements that occurred between Native American nations and Europeans. These textbooks often emphasize the conflicts, which lead to the inaccurate idea that Native Americans are particularly warlike." - Central Michigan University

Traditional school textbooks tend to lean towards one perspective - the White, majority perspective. This is largely due to the fact that the developers and writers of these textbooks fall into that category as well. By encouraging the presentation of perspectives from multiple individuals, students are able to better view the world, both past and present. As the saying goes, there are (at least) two sides to every story but our textbooks are not demonstrating that.

First Ship Seen by the Clatsop: "In an apparent twist of history, it was not the Americans who were first among the group of civilized Christian nations that settled in Oregon. In about 1725 a Spanish trading ship, perhaps a galleon, wrecked on the coast, in the vicinity of the Columbia River Estuary. Spanish ships had been exploring the region for much of the 18th century, yet records of their travels were not well kept. There were likely several wrecks on the coast. The Spanish had begun a vigorous trade with the Asian mainland, and it was a Spanish wreck that likely deposited beeswax from China in the Tillamook area, on the Nehalem spit in either 1693 or 1705. Scattered legends of the 1725 wreck and its survivors have been passed down through the tribes of the region." -Quartux

The Oregon Trail: The Oregon Trail was a wagon road stretching 2170 miles from Missouri to Oregon's Willamette Valley. It was not a road in any modern sense, only parallel ruts leading across endless prairie, sagebrush desert, and mountains. From the 1840s through the 1880s, thousands trekked westward, carrying only a few belongings and supplies for the journey, and settling on the western frontier, forever changing the American West."
"Indians living along the route watched the growing number of emigrants with curiosity, suspicion, and the anxiety of unexpected and unwanted change to their way of life. Wise leaders of both sides made an effort to avoid trouble, and for the most part succeeded. Many Indians traded with wagon groups providing crucial food and supplies to emigrants, and offered guide services through difficult or dangerous crossings at rivers." -BLM

Websites:

Consider Native Americans' perspectives of history and of today:

https://www.cmich.edu/diversity/OID/central_mich_chippewas/Pages/Native_Americans_Perspectives.aspx

Recognizing Native American Perspectives: Thanksgiving and the National Day of Mourning:

<https://www.nationalgeographic.org/activity/recognizing-native-american-perspectives-thanksgiving-and-national-day-mourning/>

First Newcomers: Soto on the Columbia:

<https://ndnhistoryresearch.com/2016/07/21/soto-on-the-columbia/>

Basic Facts About the Oregon Trail:

https://www.blm.gov/sites/blm.gov/files/learn_interp_nhotc_historybasics.pdf

VOCABULARY

- **Perspective:** a particular attitude toward or way of regarding something; a point of view

Opening

Begin by asking students what the term “perspective” means.

Review and discuss vocabulary terms with students. After reviewing the vocabulary, ask students what the term “Native perspective” means.

Explain to students that oftentimes, the Native American perspective is not heard in traditional textbooks. We often hear of Native history through accounts of immigrants or settlers, which is called “settlers’ perspective”. The Native perspective is the experiences of the Native Americans told from their viewpoint.

Activity

1. Hand out the two readings to the students. Explain to the students that one article, “The First Ship Seen by the Clatsop” is from the Native American perspective and describes their feelings and thoughts about the first Spaniards they came into contact with. The second reading includes letters, journal entries, and diary entries made by White women settlers traveling on the Oregon Trail and describes their thoughts and feelings about their first impressions about Native Americans.
2. Complete the two readings as a whole-class read aloud, in partners, or individually.
3. After the readings are complete, have students work in partners to complete the Venn Diagram, comparing the two perspectives and analyzing how the different perspectives contribute to the feelings in the articles.
4. Pass out the Compare & Contrast worksheet. Review the directions and then discuss the questions as a class. Students can complete the worksheet individually, in partners, or as a whole class.

Closure

Have students display their Venn Diagrams in the classroom

Differentiation

- Students can work together as much as needed
- The Venn Diagram can be completed at multiple points in the lesson depending on the level of support needed

Extension

- Students who finish early can think of other situations where there may be multiple perspectives and create a Venn Diagram for those perspectives

Notes/Other

Jan Michael Looking Wolf's or Grand Ronde Canoe Family audio tracks can be played as background music while students are working. These audio tracks can be found on Spotify or Apple Music.

Jan Michael Looking Wolf: [Spotify](#) and [Apple Music](#)

Grand Ronde Canoe Family: [Spotify](#) and [Apple Music](#)

Appendix

Compare & Contrast Worksheet:

https://drive.google.com/file/d/1pL_-ut4qfw-WSVEaB94woDnLHv4bvJex/view?usp=sharing

"First Ship Seen by the Clatsop":

https://drive.google.com/file/d/1XTS0_H0Q7s_BuVW_Xt7Z4TUlxNrhv7i3/view?usp=sharing

Journals, Letters, and Diaries written by women on the Oregon Trail 1836-1865:

https://drive.google.com/file/d/1BhP998_fA7sEbt_dqjXZDLaEy2ym0d9/view?usp=sharing

Venn Diagram:

<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1g6dB34LNiC9DRxwR0EMVCvkIZjt-7RLO/view?usp=sharing>