



OREGON BOARD OF ACCOUNTANCY
Qualifications Committee
Minutes September 23, 2015

Committee Members Present

Alan Steiger, CPA-Retired (Chair)
Casey Camors, CPA
Christina Tate, CPA
Patrick Brown, CPA
Chuck Landers, CPA (Vice-Chair)
Rachelle Quinn, CPA
Amber White, CPA
Bryce Wilberger, CPA
David Peterson, CPA
Michael Schmidt, CPA
Roger Graham (Board Liaison)

Staff Present

Kimberly Fast, Licensing Manager
Kristen Adamson, Licensing Specialist
Joel Parks, Licensing Specialist
Julie Nadeau, Licensing Specialist

Excused Absence

Alia Adams, CPA

Guests Present

Megan Kurz, CPA
Angelo Meaderds
Derek Hines
Jack Daniels
David Manlove
Aimee Beltz
James O'Banion
Rhiannon Philbin
Luke Peterson (applicant supervisor)
Nikolai O'Connor (arr. 10:40)
Jill Ward (applicant supervisor, arr. 11:00)

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Qualifications Committee (QC) convened for a regularly scheduled meeting on September 23, 2015. Alan Steiger, CPA-Retired, Committee Chair, called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m. Mr. Steiger announced that the meeting was being recorded and called the roll.

2. APPROVE MINUTES

A. July 22, 2015

Mr. Steiger and Mr. Landers noted three grammatical corrections.

COMMITTEE ACTION: Mr. Wilberger moved to approve the July 22, 2015 minutes with corrections.

MOTION PASSED: 10 Ayes

3. REPORT OF BOARD ACTION

Mr. Graham noted that the Board accepted all of the QC's recommendations. Mr. Pittioni updated the QC on staffing changes currently taking place. Ms. Adamson is being replaced by Ms. Nadeau, and Mr. Parks will be accepting an internal promotion. Recruitments for the licensing staff are moving forward quickly to ensure a return to full staffing as soon as possible.

4. PENDING APPLICATIONS

A. Current Applications

9. Rhiannon Philbin (Schmidt)

Ms. Philbin passed the Uniform CPA examination in August 2015. Experience was gained at the following employer:

Shorenstein Realty Services 100 Months All Competencies

Mr. Schmidt described Ms. Philbin's experience, most recently as an accounting manager at Shorenstein Realty. Based on his review, Mr. Schmidt felt that she was qualified for licensure.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Approval

Mr. Schmidt moved to find that there is sufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that Rhiannon Philbin has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

Mr. Landers asked about Ms. Philbin's direct supervision, and Mr. Schmidt confirmed that while the supervisor was located in California, they had been in contact on a daily basis. Ms. Quinn asked about Competency E, noting that the only example she saw was in IT. Mr. Schmidt asked Ms. Philbin if she could identify for the committee how she performed a risk assessment. Ms. Philbin gave a brief example, but stated that she might need to come back to the question.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Deferral

Mr. Schmidt changed his motion to defer Ms. Philbin's application pending additional documentation of Competency E.

MOTION PASSED. 10 Ayes.

5. Angelo Meaderds (Brown)

Mr. Meaderds passed the Uniform CPA examination in May 2014. Experience was gained at the following employer:

United Fund Advisors, LLC 49 Months All Competencies

Mr. Brown found no issues with the direct supervision, and the write-up reflected some excellent experience. There was some reference to experience at a prior employer, but overall the out-of-place references did not negatively impact Mr. Meaderds' meeting the competencies. The typically challenging Competency E contained some strong examples.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Approval

Mr. Brown moved to find that there is sufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that Angelo Meaderds has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

Mr. Steiger questioned whether all experience was satisfactorily supervised, Mr. Meaderds described his supervision. Further, Mr. Meaderds clarified that financial statements and tax returns were submitted to an auditor for review, not approval.

MOTION PASSED: 10 Ayes

1. Aimee Beltz (Peterson)

Ms. Beltz passed the Uniform CPA examination in May 2011. Experience was gained at the following employer:

Willamette Valley Company 42 Months All Competencies

Mr. Peterson had some questions after reviewing the applicant's initial write-up, particularly on Competencies B, C, E, and F, which he felt Ms. Beltz addressed adequately in her supplemental information sent in response. Mr. Schmidt asked about the nature of Ms. Beltz' supervision. Ms. Beltz clarified that she reported to different people for different projects, but her write-up focused on the work supervised by the company's CFO. For additional projects included in the write-up, the CFO maintained involvement.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Approval

Mr. Peterson moved to find that there is sufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that Aimee Beltz has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

MOTION PASSED. 9 Ayes, 1 Abstain (Wilberger)

3. Derek Hines (White)

Mr. Hines passed the Uniform CPA examination in August 2014. Experience was gained at the following employer:

Cambia Health Solutions 13 Months All Competencies

Ms. White thought that Mr. Hines did a great job on his write-up, including not only his normal tasks, but additional project work, and other issues such as dealing with changes in his industry associated with Affordable Care Act.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Approval

Ms. White moved to find that there is sufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that Derek Hines has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

MOTION PASSED. 9 Ayes, 1 Abstain (Brown)

4. David Manlove (Landers)

Mr. Manlove passed the Uniform CPA examination in April 2015. Experience was gained at the following employer:

Holiday Retirement 34 Months All Competencies

Mr. Landers reported that the initial write-up was brief, and the revised write-up was much more detailed. Mr. Landers was satisfied with the examples provided. He confirmed that only examples from 16 month period in which Mr. Manlove's supervisor was qualified were included.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Approval

Mr. Landers moved to find that there is sufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that David Manlove has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

MOTION PASSED. 10 Ayes

7. James O'Banion (Tate)

Mr. O'Banion passed the Uniform CPA examination in November 2011. Experience was gained at the following employer:

LaCrosse Footwear Inc. 49 Months All Competencies

Ms. Tate reported that Mr. O'Banion worked as an accounting manager at LaCrosse Footwear, and she observed that he gave thorough examples of how he met the competencies. After it came to light that Mr. O'Banion's supervisor was not qualified until May 2014, he re-wrote Competency E to include examples within the acceptable timeframe. Examples applied to the competency requirements included but were not limited to participation in strategy meetings, overseeing annual evaluation of internal controls, and fixed asset valuation. In response to committee questions, Mr. O'Banion explained that his level of interaction with his supervisor, while fluctuating, was an average of five to ten hours per week.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Approval

Ms. Tate moved to find that there is sufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that James O'Banion has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

MOTION PASSED. 9 Ayes, 1 Abstain (Quinn)

8. Nikolai O'Connor (Camors)

Mr. O'Connor passed the Uniform CPA examination in August 2014. Experience was gained at the following employer:

Cambia Health Solutions 32 Months All Competencies

Ms. Camors outlined many of Mr. O'Connor's examples set forth on his application, which she felt were relevant to the competencies.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Approval

Ms. Camors moved to find that there is sufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that Nikolai O'Connor has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

MOTION PASSED. 9 Ayes, 1 Abstain (Brown)

Michael Schmidt left the meeting at 11:00 a.m.

B.1 Jack Daniels (White)

Mr. Daniels passed the Uniform CPA examination in January 2015. Experience was gained at the following employer:

WiMax Forum 16 Months All Competencies

Ms. White described the additional information submitted by the deferred applicant. Mr. Daniels outlined work experience such as a revenue tracking spreadsheet, recognizing revenue, how the GL interfaced with the company's accounting system. For the purpose of discussion, Ms. White made a motion and asked for feedback from the committee.

Ms. White moved to find that there is sufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that Jack Daniels has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

Ms. White noted that much of the experienced submitted earlier was task based, and there was little evidence of higher-order abilities. Ms. Quinn agreed. Mr. Wilberger was most concerned with Competency E, stating that he saw no evidence that the applicant was capable of risk assessment. Ms. Tate felt that most examples included on the application were administrative in nature, with little analysis of technical guidance. Mr. Steiger asked Mr. Daniels if he would like to respond to the committee's concerns. After clarifying what the committee meant by risk assessment, Mr. Daniels described the greatest risk area for the company, but was unable to thoroughly describe how he identified the risk. Ms. Ward, Mr. Daniels' supervisor called in to the meeting, and committee members continued to ask questions, trying to ascertain Mr. Daniels risk assessment abilities, as well as whether he had met the other competencies. Mr. Daniels struggled to understand what the committee needed in order to recommend his application for approval.

MOTION FAILED. 8 Ayes, 1 Abstain (Landers)

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Denial

Ms. White moved to find that there is insufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that Jack Daniels has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

Ms. Quinn felt that a move to deny the application was appropriate, as the committee had engaged in a very in-depth conversation with Mr. Daniels and his supervisor, and she was not sure what else could be covered. Mr. Daniels was given clarification on the next steps for his application, including the ability to appeal the decision

(should the Board concur with the committee) with an administrative law judge, or to reapply for licensure after gaining additional experience.

MOTION PASSED. 8 Ayes, 1 Abstain (Landers)

2. Tera Dunbar (Wilberger)

Ms. Dunbar passed the Uniform CPA examination in July 2014. Experience was gained at the following employer:

Knife River Corporation	9 Months	All Competencies
-------------------------	----------	------------------

Mr. Wilberger was unable to contact Ms. Dunbar, but he spoke with her supervisor about some concerns. First he confirmed the level of supervisory interaction, given that the signing supervisor is a regional controller in the organization, providing skipped-level supervision. Mr. Wilberger confirmed that the work products on the application reported directly to the supervisor. The write-up did not include enough information on Competencies B, D, or E. Mr. Wilberger felt that Ms. Dunbar most likely meets Competencies C, F, and G, though they were not well-documented or described.

The employment at Knife River was clearly under the 12 month minimum, but Ms. Dunbar also has 15 months at Moss Adams. It was decided that staff would obtain a more detailed response from Moss Adams, using the updated form for verification.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Deferral

Mr. Wilberger moved to defer the application of Tera Dunbar pending additional information for Competencies B-G, for verification that Ms. Dunbar has continued supervision at Knife River, and/or additional information from Moss Adams.

MOTION PASSED. 9 Ayes

5. Ryan Meyer (Adams)

Mr. Meyer passed the Uniform CPA examination in April 2013. Experience was gained at the following employer:

Sharp Labs	23 Months	All Competencies
------------	-----------	------------------

Ms. Adams was unable to attend the meeting, and Mr. Steiger read her review sent prior to the meeting: "I have reviewed Ryan's application, and though it is unfortunate that we are unable to technically consider his public accounting experience in our approval I think that just knowing he has this background provides additional assurance that Ryan is qualified. There are some strong examples, as well as examples from his supervisor in a previous write up before the format changed."

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Approval

On behalf of Ms. Adams, Mr. Steiger moved to find that there is sufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that Ryan Meyer has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

Mr. Landers felt that Competency C was weak, and Mr. Steiger felt that B, C, and D were all weak. Mr. Wilberger noted that the supervisor's write-up was stronger, but if they were to base their decision on the applicant's write-up, it couldn't be approved. He also noted that it was still unclear whether the applicant understands risk assessment.

MOTION FAILED. 9 Ayes

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Deferral

Ms. White moved to defer the application of Ryan Meyer pending additional information for Competencies A-G
MOTION PASSED. 9 Ayes

B. Deferred Applications

2. Jack Dukeminier (Quinn)

Mr. Dukeminier passed the Uniform CPA examination in November 2014. Experience was gained at the following employer:

Cogence Group, PC 22 Months All Competencies

Ms. Quinn described the multiple examples presented by Mr. Dukeminier in support of Competency D, the reason for the application's last deferral.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Approval

Ms. Quinn moved to find that there is sufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that Jack Dukeminier has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

MOTION PASSED. 9 Ayes

3. Dale Grose (Landers)

Mr. Grose passed the Uniform CPA examination in April 2014. Experience was gained at the following employer:

Monaco RV/Navistar 23 Months All Competencies

Mr. Landers gave Mr. Grose the committee's feedback, and his submission satisfied remaining questions.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Approval

Mr. Landers moved to find that there is sufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that Dale Grose has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

MOTION PASSED. 9 Ayes

The committee broke for lunch at 12:00 p.m., and reconvened at 12:28 p.m.

4. Echo Lin (Peterson)

Ms. Lin passed the Uniform CPA examination in April 2007. Experience was gained at the following employer:

CareOregon 100 Months All Competencies

Mr. Peterson described Ms. Lin's additional responses to Competencies B, D, F, and E. He was particularly concerned that the risk assessment described by Ms. Lin was oriented toward finding problems rather than performing an up-front assessment.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Denial

Mr. Peterson moved to find that there is insufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that Echo Lin has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

Ms. Quinn asked if Mr. Peterson believed that Ms. Lin could provide sufficient information, and asked why he chose to deny rather than defer the application. Mr. Peterson read his email to the Ms. Lin specifically asking for more information on Competency E. He explained that he chose to recommend denial because he has asked multiple times for examples, and each time the applicant has come up short. Mr. Landers suggested that if E is the only competency missing, perhaps Ms. Lin should have another chance to communicate her experience. Mr. Steiger confirmed that Ms. Lin's CPA Exam scores would expire if her application is denied. Mr. Landers suggested having a conversation with Ms. Lin rather than email communication only.

MOTION FAILED. 8 Nays, 1 Abstain (Tate)

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Deferral

Mr. Peterson moved to defer the application of Echo Lin pending additional documentation of Competency E.

MOTION PASSED. 8 Ayes, 1 Abstain (Tate)

5. Lane Shipley (Brown)

Mr. Shipley passed the Uniform CPA examination in November 2010. Experience was gained at the following employer:

Now CFO	12 Months	All Competencies
---------	-----------	------------------

Mr. Brown reported that he had a few conversations with Mr. Shipley leading up to the meeting, and Mr. Shipley was determined to understand and provide documentation. Mr. Shipley changed some his "I" vs. "we" terminology, and provided some good additional examples. Mr. Brown did not feel that the response to Competency E was a perfect example, referring to a policy that he wrote and implemented, but felt reasonably confident that it was addressed based on the way that the competency was written.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Approval

Mr. Brown moved to find that there is sufficient evidence to make a preliminary finding that Lane Shipley has demonstrated the competencies necessary for initial licensing per OAR 801-010-0065.

MOTION PASSED. 9 Ayes

5. OLD BUSINESS

Ms. Adamson confirmed that the DOR MOU is now fully approved and operating.

6. NEW BUSINESS

Mr. Steiger announced that Ms. Adams resigned from the Committee, and Mr. Graham introduced Ms. Kurz, who was interested in joining the committee. Ms. Kurz confirmed that she is interested in joining, and felt that being part of the committee will help keep the Lithia licensing program fresh and connected to the committee and Board.

Mr. Wilberger commented that he was disappointed in the applications written by the applicants as opposed to Mr. Brown agreed that the new procedure was required more re-working of write-ups with the applicants, and the process seemed to have had results that were the opposite of what was anticipated. Ms. Camors commented that applicants might not necessarily understand how to draw the connections between their work and the competencies. Mr. Steiger wondered if the committee was, to an extent, seeing the reality of the quality of the applicants. Mr. Graham noted that the committee could easily change the procedure back to requiring write-ups from supervisors, but it might be too early to decide. Mr. Wilberger suggested that supervisors need to have a greater understanding of the application. The committee decided to begin providing more information to supervisors as part of the process. Ms. Fast suggested a letter, Mr. Graham suggested sending a list of common mistakes, and Ms. Tate advocated speaking with supervisors, effectively bypassing some of the more emotional applicants in order to get more clarity. Ms. Camors suggested an FAQ sheet for supervisors, clarifying their responsibility in the process. Mr. Steiger asked the committee to keep in mind what would be best to have as part of an FAQ for supervisors going forward.

Ms. White noted that Ms. Beltz' revised information was particularly well-formatted and easy to review, the committee agreed and asked that future application revisions and supplements feature additions in in bold type.

Mr. Steiger confirmed that the next meeting will be held via teleconference on November 18.

The meeting was adjourned at 1:14 p.m.

DRAFT