

Summary of Six Air Toxics Health-Risk Based Permitting Programs by Program Element

This table compares program elements in current state regulations that apply to air toxics from permitted facilities

Issue Paper		State and Local Air Toxics Programs						
Program Element		Louisville	New Jersey	New York	Rhode Island	South Coast	Washington	Oregon (proposed)
Applicability	1 Include existing sources in program?	new/mod/existing	new/mod/existing	new/mod/existing	new/mod/existing	new/mod/existing	new/mod	new/mod/existing
	4 What air toxics should be included in the program?	18 Category 1 TAC 19 Category 2 TAC 17 Category 3 TAC 136 Category 4 TAC	168 carcinogens, 133 chemicals with other long-term effects, 64 with short-term effects	1,091 air toxics 62 High Toxicity Air Contaminants	258 air toxics	24 high risk pollutants 150-200 permit pollutants 450 Hot Spots chemicals 187 HAPs	398 air toxics	Reporting: ~660 air toxics Health risk based permitting: ~215 air toxics.
Pollutant Scope and Setting Concentration Levels	9 Cumulative risk from multiple sources within an area?	10.0 in 1 million cancer risk & HQ of 1 for individual TAC	not included	Included in modeling to determine Environmental Rating	not included	Included in Clean Communities Plan (not regulatory)	Included in modeling as informational only	20-80 in 1 million for all air toxics HI 2-4
	14 Allowable risk levels	New/Modified emissions unit: 1 in 1 million & HQ 1, per individual air toxic	New/modified emissions unit: 100 in 1 million & HQ 1 for all air toxics, case-by-case review by Risk Management Committee, permitted if risk acceptably minimized	New/modified emissions unit: Meet required degree of cleaning or apply TBACT AND 10 in 1 million & HI 2, cumulative over all air toxics		New/Modified emissions unit: 1 in 1 million & HI 1 New/Modified equipment with TBACT: 10 in 1 million	New emissions unit: 1 in 1 million	New emissions unit: 1 in 1 million & HI 1 New emissions unit w/TBACT: 5 in 1 million & HI 1
	15 Allow different risk levels for existing and new sources							
		New source: 3.8 in 1 million, cumulative for multiple air toxics Existing source: 7.5 in 1 million, cumulative for multiple air toxics	Existing sources: 10 to 100 in 1 million, requires long term risk minimization strategy 100 to 1,000 in 1 million, requires short term risk minimization strategy		New/Modified Source: 1 in 1 million & HQ 1 for each air toxic OR 10 in 1 million and HQ 1 for each air toxic with LAER	Existing source: 25 in 1 million "action risk levels" & organ-specific hazard index of 3 100 in 1 million "significant risk levels" & organ-specific hazard index of 5	New source: 10 in 1 million	New & existing sources: 10 in 1 million & HI 1
If risk higher than screening levels	Requires TBACT if risk levels not met, allows for higher risk level, ongoing improvement	>1000 in 1 million enforcement, permit may be denied	Requires TBACT for new/mod sources if degree of cleaning not met, permit may be denied	Requires LAER, permit may be denied	Requires TBACT for new sources; requires Risk Reduction Plan for existing sources, permit may be denied	Requires TBACT for new/mod sources over de minimis, permit may be denied	Requires Risk Reduction Plan and Community Engagement Plan, allows for higher risk level, ongoing improvement, permit may be denied if area cumulative risk too high	