

Materials Management Program

Recycling Modernization Act: Material List Technical Workgroup

Meeting Summary: Meeting #3

May 31, 2022

Zoom

List of Technical Workgroup Members in attendance

- Dan Weston
- Dave Larmouth
- Dave Lefebvre (for Nicole Willet)
- David McCall
- Gabe Forrester
- Jerry Powell
- Kate Eagles
- Kim Holmes
- Laura Leebrick
- Liz Bedard
- Rosalynn Greene
- Wayne Jackson

DEQ project staff

- Cheryl Grabham
- David Allaway
- Justin Gast
- Peter Canepa



State of Oregon
Department of
Environmental
Quality

Materials Management
700 NE Multnomah St.,
Suite 600
Portland, OR 97232
Phone: 503-229-5479
Contact: David Allaway

www.oregon.gov/DEQ

*DEQ is a leader in
restoring, maintaining and
enhancing the quality of
Oregon's air, land and
water.*

Time	Topic
8:30 a.m.	<p>Introductions, agenda review, context/update Justin Gast welcomed and thanked Technical Workgroup members and reviewed the agenda.</p> <p>David Allaway then provided a short update. He thanked the group members for contributing to progress to date, and noted that by the end of this meeting, the group will have completed an initial review of most materials (with economic and environmental evaluation results being shared later). Regarding the preliminary evaluation matrix, he noted that only a few changes had been made in response to comments at the April 28 meeting, but that more will be made in the coming months. All evaluation scores remain preliminary and are offered to generate discussion, but if no discussion occurs on a given score DEQ will likely confirm it as is. Importantly, the draft rules that result from this evaluation will be the next but not final step in the evolution of Oregon's recycling systems; the Act provides multiple "on-ramps" for materials to be reconsidered for inclusion in recycling lists in the future.</p>
8:40 a.m.	<p>Metals Justin Gast introduced Nicholas Georges of the Household & Consumer Products Association as a guest for this agenda item.</p> <p>Justin and David then led the workgroup through discussions on the topics of aluminum foil and pressed foil products, aerosol cans, paint cans and large appliances. The group discussed several of DEQ's preliminary evaluation scores for those materials.</p> <p>A few topics generated the most discussion, including the following:</p>

Meeting Summary



State of Oregon
Department of
Environmental
Quality

Materials Management

700 NE Multnomah St.,
Suite 600
Portland, OR 97232
Phone: 503-229-5479
Contact: David Allaway

www.oregon.gov/DEQ

DEQ is a leader in restoring, maintaining and enhancing the quality of Oregon's air, land and water.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Collecting aluminum foil and pressed foil products via drop-off (via on-route) could reduce yield loss at both MRFs and smelters, and may also reduce contamination and encourage reuse. Drop-off opportunities may be significantly improved (for many materials) under implementation of the Recycling Modernization Act than they are at present. There are significant concerns involving potential hazards from aerosol cans, especially if not emptied. British Columbia currently collects these at the curb but is considering a change. Tillamook County collects them only through its household hazardous waste program (even cooking oil cans). An HCPA analysis suggests the risk is very low; HCPA is undertaking additional research this year. Aerosols could be contributing to MRF fires, but there is very poor evidence to prove that is the case; the cause of some fires is never identified. Commercial sources may be a higher source of risk (due to potential for higher concentration) than residential. Regarding appliances, those with refrigerants require additional handling.
9:00 a.m.	<p>Foamed Plastics</p> <p>Justin introduced Matt Durbin of Agilyx as a guest for this agenda item. David McCall then provided an overview of how expanded polystyrene (EPS) from Tillamook County is collected, densified, and recycled.</p> <p>Peter Canepa shared the results of a preliminary life cycle assessment of different scenarios for managing EPS at end of life. He reiterated that the results were preliminary and were not comparing EPS against other materials. (See slides.) A few high-level results include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Generator driving distance (to drop-off site) has the potential of adding significantly to environmental impacts. The location of a densifier (at point of collection vs. at a nearby consolidation point) makes relatively little difference. There are trade-offs between impacts of densification and the impacts of transporting undensified EPS. For some impact categories, there is a significant difference in both impacts and benefits between mechanical recycling and chemical recycling, and in some cases, a significant difference between both forms of recycling and landfilling. <p>Workgroup members and Matt Durbin asked several questions of Peter including whether he could evaluate a domestic mechanical recycler; whether the study accounted for potential losses due to mismanagement, worker exposure, geographic differences, and impacts of litter; how the boundaries of the analysis were drawn; assumptions regarding density and size of trucks; information on consumer behavior; and the magnitude of impacts vs. other materials. DEQ also invited workgroup members to provide feedback or questions on the preliminary ratings for foamed plastics.</p>
10:20 a.m.	<p>Films and other flexible packaging</p> <p>Justin introduced the following guests for this and the following agenda items:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Alison Keane and Sam Schlaich – Flexible Packaging Association Tonya Randell – Stina Inc.

Meeting Summary



State of Oregon
Department of
Environmental
Quality

Materials Management

700 NE Multnomah St.,
Suite 600
Portland, OR 97232
Phone: 503-229-5479
Contact: David Allaway

www.oregon.gov/DEQ

DEQ is a leader in restoring, maintaining and enhancing the quality of Oregon's air, land and water.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nicole Janssen – Denton Plastics • Martin Vogt – EFS Plastics <p>David then shared a summary of DEQ’s preliminary ratings for films and other flexible packaging, noting that DEQ proposes no further evaluation on films other than polyethylene bags and wraps. Discussion included the following topics:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant new investments in polyethylene film recycling, including wash lines to remove inks. • Challenges with bag-to-bag recycling; the plastic lumber market is more forgiving of contaminants. • Contamination reduction resulting from public education; importance of labels. • Responsibility in some foreign markets. • Agreement from Flexible Packaging Association that polypropylene and multi-material films are not ready for designation yet but are good candidates for PRO engagement. • Contamination in residential vs. commercial sources.
11:10 a.m.	<p>Other plastic packaging and products >6 fluid ounces (excluding food serviceware)</p> <p>Justin facilitated discussion and feedback on a long list of materials (see evaluation matrix and agenda for full list).</p> <p>The following topics generated the most discussion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Apparent inconsistencies in preliminary ratings between similar materials. • Importance of seeking feedback from MRF operators (none attended this portion of the agenda). • Recyclability of bulky plastic items, including perceived challenges both at the point of collection and at MRFs; strength of end markets. Some workgroup members noted that collection of bulky plastics shouldn’t include bulky plastic toys, as there’s too many mixed materials. • Challenges and recent advancements involving recycling of squeezable tubes; expected changes in toothpaste packaging in the next few years. It was noted that the three biggest toothpaste manufacturers (Colgate-Palmolive, Procter & Gamble and GSK) intend to convert all their toothpaste tubes over to solid HDPE in the near future. Some TWG members were worried about how to educate the public on which tubes are recyclable and which tubes aren’t.
11:40 p.m.	<p>Lunch</p>
12:10 pm.	<p>Other plastic packaging and products >6 fluid ounces (excluding food serviceware), continued</p> <p>Justin continued facilitating discussion on materials. Several MRF operators and two plastics reclaimers (Martin Vogt and Nicole Denton) discussed markets for polypropylene; they also shared information (along with Matt Durbin) regarding recycling of polystyrene packaging (not foamed).</p>
12:30 p.m.	<p>Small format plastic packaging, lids, caps and similar materials</p> <p>Justin introduced Gary Panknin of PakTech as a guest for this agenda item. He then introduced DEQ’s preliminary ratings for small format plastic packaging and invited feedback. Items generating the most discussion included:</p>

Meeting Summary



State of Oregon
Department of
Environmental
Quality

Materials Management

700 NE Multnomah St.,
Suite 600
Portland, OR 97232
Phone: 503-229-5479
Contact: David Allaway

www.oregon.gov/DEQ

DEQ is a leader in restoring, maintaining and enhancing the quality of Oregon's air, land and water.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Market demand for lids; benefits of dual stream collection (keeping lids from being commingled with fiber). • Recovery of small-format plastics in a new “unders” recovery system at the EFI MRF. Practicalities of baling, storing, and sorting small format packaging. • Importance of maintaining flexibility as packaging materials and formats are likely to continue changing. • Bottle caps vs. lids; disagreement between workgroup members regarding the advisability of telling the public “caps on” vs. “caps off”; curiosity about why ORPET/ORBC accepts caps on; possibility of recycling lids and caps together if collected via drop-off. • HDPE 6-pack carriers; efforts by PakTech test how their product flows through a MRF; potential compatibility of HDPE 6-pack carriers with LDPE rings (similar melt point).
1:05 p.m.	<p>Public input Justin made a second call for public input. None was offered.</p>
1:05 p.m.	<p>Plastic food serviceware Justin introduced two additional guests for this agenda item:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ashley Elzinga – Foodservice Packaging Institute • Resa Dimino – Signalfire Group / Resource Recycling Systems <p>Justin facilitated discussion regarding DEQ’s preliminary ratings of food serviceware items. Discussion centered on the following topics:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Composition of clear cups; deselection of polystyrene and shifting towards polypropylene by producers, quick serve restaurants. • Performance of food serviceware in a MRF. • Expectations regarding ongoing research and investment in PET thermoform recycling. • Historic Foodservice Packaging Institute research into contamination in food serviceware; concerns with potential cross-contamination of fiber. David Allaway and Laura Leebrick expressed skepticism that food serviceware is no more contaminated than general purpose packaging (a primary finding of FPI’s research). Liz Bedard speculated that food serviceware from households would be cleaner than from nonresidential sources. • Resa Dimino noted no discernable difference (regarding MRF practices or end markets) between polypropylene packaging and polypropylene food serviceware. This perspective was confirmed by Nicole Janssen.
1:25 p.m.	<p>Next steps, outstanding questions David thanked the group for their ongoing participation and invited feedback on meeting agendas, content and style. He also asked technical workgroup members to share with DEQ by June 10th any other materials not yet included in the evaluation matrix (and excluding glass packaging, which is slated for discussion at the next meeting) that members believe should be evaluated for potential inclusion in mandatory recycling lists for Oregon.</p>
1:30 p.m.	<p>Adjourn.</p>

Note: Some times listed above are approximations.

Meeting Summary

List of other attendees

Colette Bazirgan
Trevor Beltz
Molly Blessing
Janine Bogar
Abby Boudouris
Jessica Branom-Zwick
Travis Comfort
Shannon Crawford
Resa Dimino
Aaron Donley
Matt Durbin
Thomas Egleston
Ashley Elzinga
Nicholas Georges
Patrick Gieske

Laurie Gordon
Shari Jackson
Nicole Janssen
Alison Keane
Scott Keller
Diane Landry
KJ Lewis
Jake Lowenstein
Matt Markee
Katy McDowell
Casey Mellnik
Devon Morales
Jeff Murray
Leah Navarro
Caitlin Newman

Barbara Ochota
Gary Okey
Carolina Paez
Gary Panknin
Tonya Randell
Cat Rhoades
Gretchen Sandau
Sam Schlaich
Hannah Scholes
Tim Shestek
Vinod Singh
Joyce Thung
Nickole Vargas
Martin Vogt
Mark Watts

Alternative formats

DEQ can provide documents in an alternate format or a language other than English upon request. Call DEQ at 800-452-4011 or email deqinfo@deq.state.or.us.



State of Oregon
Department of
Environmental
Quality

Materials Management

700 NE Multnomah St.,
Suite 600
Portland, OR 97232
Phone: 503-229-5479
Contact: David Allaway

www.oregon.gov/DEQ

*DEQ is a leader in
restoring, maintaining and
enhancing the quality of
Oregon's air, land and
water.*