



Oregon Energy Strategy
 Policy Working Group breakout sessions –
 Environmental Justice and Equity Meeting 2
April 14, 2025, 9:00-11:00

Post-Meeting Notes

Meeting Summary

Mary Kopriva (ODOE) presented research on important Energy Strategy considerations that are not fully addressed by the energy pathways modeling or complementary analyses; these considerations include affordability in the energy transition; access to adopting new, lower-carbon technologies; and education, resources, and tools that could be used to support changes in consumer behavior. Lauren Rosenstein (ODOE) reviewed issues and barriers identified by other policy working groups through these lens and draft issue statements for the Environmental Justice and Equity PWG. Lauren facilitated digital whiteboard exercises to brainstorm and discuss strategies to address barriers identified by other PWGs. Lauren adjourned the meeting by encouraging PWG members to review and consider the Washington Energy Strategy’s process for incorporating environmental justice and equity perspectives into its analysis; Lauren invited feedback on this framework and on the strategies brainstormed during the meeting through ODOE’s Energy Strategy [comment portal](#).

In-Meeting Notes

Participants

ODOE	Oregon Agencies	WG Members
Lauren Rosenstein	Eric Main, Oregon Health Authority	Christina Zamora, KLCAS
Hugh Arceneaux		Mark Healy
Josh Price		John Seng, Spark Northwest
Edith Bayer		Amber Faist, Coquell Indian Tribe and NW Native Chamber
Mary Kopriva		Jess, Rogue Climate
Jessica Reichers		Silvia Tanner, Multnomah County
Rob Del Mar		Alma Pinto, NW Energy Coalition
Ruchi Sadhir		Greer Klepacki, CEP
Michael Freels		Zachary Mulholland, Beyond Toxics
Jillian DiMedio		Sarah Wochele
		Ranfis Villatoro, BlueGreen Alliance
		Sarah Wochele, CUB
		John Maddalena, SEI

Introduction

- Lauren Rosenstein (ODOE) introduced the call and ODOE team members. Lauren introduced ODOE's mission and WebEx functionality.
- Lauren introduced the purpose of this policy working group (PWG) as elevating environmental justice concerns, especially as they pertain to conversations held in the other PWGs.
- Lauren introduced the meeting's objectives and the meeting agenda. Lauren added that, if additional ad hoc meetings would be valuable to PWG members, ODOE is happy to explore that option. Meeting objectives include:
 - Connect research and strategies to address the barriers identified in the February 24 meeting
 - Debrief what we heard last meeting, some key takeaways/barriers from other working groups, and begin to identify strategies to address those barriers
 - Decide if the group would like to provide high-level guidance/best practices on developing future energy policy
- Lauren also provided a slide highlighting the PWG member roster and the organizations they represent.¹
- Lauren went over the group agreements for PWG meetings, asking that PWG members provide comments or additions in the chat. Lauren added that, on the subject of being mindful of speaking time, she asks that people speak up when relevant topics are raised in the course of the meeting.
- Lauren asked that members introduce themselves in the chat and identify something they're curious about in today's Energy Strategy meeting.
 - *from Sarah Wochele to everyone: Hi all, Sarah Wochele (she/her), Oregon Citizens' Utility Board (CUB). I was not here last time, so I am just generally curious to better understand what this phase is about*
 - *from Christina Zamora to everyone: Christina Zamora, Klamath and Lake Community Action Services, she/ella, curious about how instability at the federal level will affect this work and how we will navigate going forward*
 - *from Jess, Rogue Climate she/they to all panelists: Hello! Jess Grady-Benson (she.they), Rogue Climate, I'm curious about the connection between the different working groups and how to bring it all together in a cohesive energy strategy*
 - *from Greer Klepacki CEP to everyone: Greer Klepacki, Policy & Advocacy Manager at Community Energy Project, he/they. Interested to see where go from here with building on previous sessions' work*
 - *from John Maddalena he/him SEI-Energy Program Manager to everyone: curious how the rest of this year works out and impacts to the Energy community*
 - *from Zach Mulholland to everyone: Zach Mulholland - Beyond Toxics. Funding electrification rebate programs commensurate with need. Redirecting subsidies for new natural gas equipment (Energy Trust of Oregon) to rebates for efficient all-electric appliances.*

¹ For the full presentation materials, refer to <https://www.oregon.gov/energy/Data-and-Reports/Documents/2025-04-14-OES-PWG-EJ-Equity-Presentation.pdf>

- *from John Seng to everyone: John Seng (he/him) Policy Manager at Spark Northwest. Curious how we can best fortify Oregon's energy plans and programs against fed. threats*
- *from Amber Faist to everyone: Amber Faist, Programs Director at the Northwest Native Chamber, Coquille Tribal Citizen.*
- *From Mark Healy to everyone: Mark Healy, Coquille Tribe Climate Resilience Task Force. I am interested in how ODOE is thinking about federal policies that are opposed to what we are doing.*
- *from Alma Pinto to everyone: Alma Pinto (she/her), NW Energy Coalition. I echo Christina's curiosity.*
- *from Eric Main he/him to everyone: 9:14 AM*
- *Eric Main (he/him) - Oregon Health Authority. Figuring out what is measurable at a community level.*
- *from Silvia to everyone: 9:15 AM*
- *Silvia Tanner (she/her), Multnomah County Office of Sustainability. Curious about how could this energy strategy voice the need for future research and analysis on how we can make sure all Oregonians can access the energy they need.*
- Lauren reviewed the step-by-step process being followed in the PWGs and explained that today's meeting will be focused identifying strategies to address barriers discussed in the prior PWG meeting.

Connecting Research and Strategies²

- Mary explained that ODOE has collected microeconomic research to supplement the energy pathways modeling and respond to barriers identified by PWG members. Mary explained that the pathways modeling provides for economy-wide cost minimization, but that it does not address distributional factors. Mary explains that the role of the PWG and additional research provided here is intended to fill in those distributional gaps.
- Affordability including the questions:
 - Who has benefited from clean energy incentives?
 - What factors contribute to disparities in uptake of incentives?
 - What types of incentives may result in fewer disparities?
 - Mary reviewed a Borenstein & Davis (2025) study on tax credit usage
 - This study reviewed distribution of tax credit uptake; this study found that 60 percent of tax credits were received by the top quintile of households, while the bottom quintile only received 10 percent. These findings are consistent with other studies.
 - Mary presented a chart highlighting exponential energy and EV credit-per-return rates based on increasing household income
 - The Borenstein paper explained the regressivity of these credit uptakes may result from 1: credits being nonrefundable, and therefore of no value to households that pay no taxes, and 2: that renters and landlords are not eligible for heat-pump and EE credits; one third of US households are rentals, so this omission is significant.

² Presentation materials are available at [2025-04-14-OES-PWG-EJ-Equity-Presentation.pdf](https://www.oregon.gov/energy/2025-04-14-OES-PWG-EJ-Equity-Presentation.pdf).

- Mary explains that this first point has been somewhat addressed by provisions allowing buyers to transfer EV credits to eligible entities, such as a car dealer, as part of a vehicle purchase.
 - Additional findings:
 - Mary reviewed research indicating that it can be difficult to target subsidies to those who would not have purchased EVs otherwise; incentives that provide upfront funding rather than financial benefits over time, may result in more equitable incentive uptake; and EV subsidies in California targeting low- and middle-income households showed that the subsidies were passed on to customers at effectively a 100 percent rate, indicating that dealers were not raising prices to respond to that subsidy
- Access, including the questions:
 - What non-monetary factors are related to adoption of more efficient technologies?
 - How do these non-monetary factors contribute to disparities in uptake of different technologies?
 - Mary reviewed a Davis (2024) study on the Economic Determinants of Heat Pump Adoption and the finding that heat pump adoption is strongly correlated with geography, climate, and electricity prices rather than income
 - *John Seng, chat: May have missed this - does adoption only count newly installed heat pumps in the last few years? I know a lot of homes in the South have had them for a long time*
 - Mary: will review the Davis study and underlying data more closely to get back with this information; the Kirkpatrick study does examine only newly installed heat pumps
 - Mary says this finding is consistent with other researching indicating that non-subsidy factors such as charging infrastructure, product quality and/or cultural acceptance may have stronger impacts on EV uptake
 - Additionally, supply side factors may contribute to the unequal adoption of solar PV systems with low-income and Black households receiving fewer bids, and Black households being quoted higher prices
- Education, Resources, and Tools
 - Mary reviewed Gillingham, Keyes, and Palmer (2018), “Advances in Evaluating Energy Efficiency Policies and Programs”; this literature review suggests that market failures based on information and behavioral failures may explain the energy efficiency equity gap. Mary explains that efficient markets are rare in the real world and an example of a market failure would be pollution and markets that do not internalize the costs of externalities such as pollution. In the case of this study, an information failure might indicate a lack of information as to prospective savings from EE measures. The behavioral failure refers to instances where rational economic choices are not followed
 - Mary reviewed Allcott & Rogers (2014) “The Short-Run and Long-Run Effects of Behavioral Interventions: Experimental Evidence from Energy Conservation” as a study of a strategy to address informational and behavioral failures. This papers shows that sending information about one’s energy expenditures relative to neighbors can reduce energy use. Mary reviewed the study’s findings as highlighting that cueing impacts from

sharing information can have valuable short-term effects and that long term effects may follow from things like adopting more efficient technologies.

- Mary also shared studies indicating that installers learning as they gain more experience can reduce costs for Solar PV installations; energy efficiency appliance labeling can increase the likelihood of consumers choosing more energy efficient appliances but information on lifetime cost savings is likely more effective than information on an energy rating scale; and providing information about an EV charger’s real-time status could increase EV uptake particularly if paired with increased charger uptime and greater consumer belief in charger reliability.

What we heard in the last meeting

- Lauren reflects summaries of barriers and issues identified by the Environmental Justice and Equity PWG.
- Lauren reviewed her synthesis of PWG themes at a high level, emphasizing that these are being presented as a draft and as a very high level synthesis; ODOE is looking for PWG member feedback on these themes and expects they may be amended as PWG work proceeds. The identified themes include:
 - Access;
 - Affordability;
 - Workforce; and
 - Education/Resources/Tools.³
- Additionally, there were barriers faced by specific communities, such as homeowners and renters; governmental barriers around things like agency coordination; and barriers from geographical and educational constraints. The PWG also raised concerns around disproportionate impact from things like mining, water, and air quality impacts.

Whiteboard exercises on what ODOE is hearing from other PWGs

- Lauren explained that we will be using Miro to reflect on the issues and strategies being discussed in other PWGs.

Low-Carbon Fuels

- Lauren reviewed draft issue statements from the Low-Carbon Fuels PWG, aligned against the main environmental justice and equity themes. Lauren explained that she added an item for siting and environmental concerns as a particular and unique element of Low-Carbon Fuels to examine from an environmental justice and equity perspective.
- Lauren provided 3 minutes of quiet brainstorming to speak to strategies
- Regarding workforce:
 - Amber explains that her sticky relates to funding and grants to community-based or training organizations fails to provide for accomplishing projects and installations; because funding is divorced between these types of programs, it’s hard to ensure that quality jobs reach communities where they’re needed. Need more comprehensive programs for them to truly be transformative in a community.

³ Issue statements associated with these categories are available at [2025-04-14-OES-PWG-EJ-Equity-Presentation.pdf](#). at slide 33.

- Mary asks about a slide regarding leveraging entities trusted by businesses; would this be creating a space for business owners to come together, or coordinating with a trusted partner?
 - Christina Zamora; her mind went to Chambers of Commerce as a trusted vehicle to provide information. SBA could also be a partner on the business side.
- Lauren; regarding an uncategorized column, there be issues in siting and addressing AQ impacts and hard No's to siting; Lauren interested in exploring a strategy or solution or rulemaking across this issue. Does this pertain to Community Benefits Plans, and whether they're sufficient or what they should include.
 - Silvia: says she's heard about siting of h2 facilities in California, and the discussion often pertains to grid benefits and when they offset environmental issues. Says some impacts may be unacceptable, and community engagement problem should allow for communities to simply say no to some impacts.
 - *from Sarah Wochele to everyone: thanks for that Silvia*
 - *from Jess, Rogue Climate she/they to all panelists: ++ Silvia*
 - Silvia's strategy aligns with the sticky above hers regarding updating land use regulation for siting of new fuel infrastructure to have safety, air quality, distance from schools, hospitals, environmental justice communities prioritized.
- Jess, Rogue Climate; expresses appreciation for Silvia. Says it's hard, in the context of EVs and low-carbon fuels, that both of these approaches involve sacrifices and impacts, such as lithium mining; says it's hard to capture in siting, but focusing on how to reduce need for these mining impacts while exploring low-carbon transportation options
- John Seng; appreciates discussion around mining. Thinks lithium recycling and other recycling should be discussed as a solution.
 - *from Sarah Wochele to everyone: @jess not sure if you are familiar with this think tank, but they do great work talking about mining and transit solutions: <https://climateandcommunity.org/transportation-mining/>*
 - *from Sarah Wochele to everyone: particularly this report: <https://climateandcommunity.org/research/more-mobility-less-mining/>*
 - *from Jess, Rogue Climate she/they to all panelists: yes! I really appreciate their resources thanks Sarah*
 - *from Sarah Wochele to everyone: i love them*
 - *from Jess, Rogue Climate she/they to all panelists: ++ John - recycling, prioritizing smaller vehicles etc.*
- Regarding "I don't understand bullet two, saying decarbonization will increase the cost of fossil fuels. What is this assumption based on?"
 - Michael; as customers electrify, there will be fewer consumers of fossil fuels while maintenance costs for fossil fuel infrastructure may remain flat. That may lead to fuel costs increasing for customers, as there will be fewer customers among whom fixed infrastructure maintenance costs would be distributed.
 - *from Sarah Wochele to everyone: there are less people in the pool to share costs of gas, low income folks stranded in this pool*
 - *from Zach Mulholland to everyone: So higher maintenance costs, same fuel costs? Fuel costs could come down as demand shifts to electricity and cheaper renewables.*

Transportation Electrification

- Lauren reviewed the draft issue statements for the PWG; Lauren provided 3 minutes of quiet brainstorming to speak to strategies
- Lauren says youth are a priority community in Oregon, and providing EV funding that's accessible to rural and coastal communities is valuable to consider
- Mary: regarding utilizing apprenticeship programs, wonders if that can be expanded upon?
 - Ranfis, BlueGreen Alliance; there's a tragedy of the commons situation where contractors don't want to train apprentices. It'd be worthwhile to provide that, across the board, the workforce for EV infrastructure provide apprentice training; absent addressing this market shortcoming, there will be a perpetual labor shortfall. Setting an apprenticeship utilization goal could be sufficient on its own without further state investments or funding because RAPs are a proven program.
- Lauren: regarding supporting EVs and knock-on effects from expanding parking lot needs and resulting environmental impacts, such as heat islands and air pollution; consider impacts of this outcome to Oregonians who cannot afford cars
 - Sarah Wochele, reflecting on experience in Las Vegas and roads; there are multiple pathways to making transportation more efficient, and EVs are not the only solution. Directing resources towards walkable city design and providing improved access in rural communities would be valuable
 - Lauren reflects seeing bike and e-bike strategies elsewhere in Miro
 - *from Greer Klepacki CEP to everyone: yes! safe bike lanes are soooo needed.*
 - *from Jess, Rogue Climate she/they to all panelists: ++ and in rural & coastal communities!*

Building Electrification, Efficiency, and Distributed Energy Resources (DERs)

- Lauren reviewed the draft issue statements for the PWG; Lauren provided 3 minutes of quiet brainstorming to speak to strategies
- John, regarding policy to tax data centers to fund resources for low income households; says there's a bill in Minnesota underway to do just that.
- Jess; they're a community navigator for Jackson County; regarding a heat pump program there, a challenge has been the learning curve to build skills and understanding HVAC incentive schemes. However, the funding lasts only a year or two, leading to loss of this training and skill; there's a need for consistency and training in programs to support transition from program advocacy to program implementation
 - Lauren; appreciates that input, reflects that it's consistent with input elsewhere that admin funding is often insufficient to adequately support programs.

Developing Clean Electricity Generation and Transmission

- Lauren reviewed the draft issue statements for the PWG. Lauren provided 3 minutes of quiet brainstorming to speak to strategies
- Lauren reviewed, read aloud some of the strategies she saw brainstormed, including one regarding supporting tribally owned and operated utilities
 - *from Greer Klepacki CEP to everyone: I didn't write that but assuming utilizing tribal owned utilities on projects? Just my guess.*

Conclusion and next steps

- Lauren quickly reviewed Washington’s seven-step process for building equity into clean energy policies and said she would send an email gauging members’ interest in this process.
- Lauren reviewed upcoming meeting dates and the upcoming 4/30 meeting to review potential policy actions.
- Lauren invited PWG members to provide additional comment through the [comment portal](#)
- Lauren thanked PWG members for their participation and adjourned the meeting

Whiteboards

Whiteboard Exercise 1: Low-Carbon Fuels

Low-Carbon Fuels <i>Strategies to Address Barriers</i>
ACCESS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • grants for community-based orgs to purchase EV vans • allow for fuel switching in low income ee/wx programs from ETO and those offered by IOUs (+1) • EV charge stations connected to powerlines on every city block • provide information/ outreach in plain language and multiple languages (+1) • Leverage others who are trusted by businesses to increase awareness • prioritize investment in decarbonized public transit in rural + coastal communities • Look at special • prioritization for collective ownership models for multi family and housing developments • Incentives for schools to transition to electric bus fleets including charging infrastructure • Create something new: Surveys with implementation plans of rural, tribal and other communities to see access needs • Add to something that exists: More \$ for EV incentives so they don't run out after 2 months
EDUCATION/RESOURCES/TOOLS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Informational fairs to show community members how strategies correlate • community navigators designated in trusted institutions to lead education programs in community • Create something new: Paid education opportunities for community members on relevant topics
WORKFORCE
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Addressing challenges related to funding pots that separate training programs from funding to actually do upgrades and new installs. • workforce dev is often focused on city/suburbs and less on rural - invest in rural workforce dev/ create incentives (idk how to make this strategy, its more a barrier) • partnering with existing programs at community colleges • utilize existing apprenticeship programs. Partner with trades to bring remote apprenticeship training opportunities • apprenticeship utilization goals • pay family health and retirement • Ensure a skilled and trained workforce is being utilized on critical infrastructure • promote partnerships between community colleges and union apprenticeship programs • promote community workforce agreements

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ensure state agency support to protect workers health and safety, and wages promote stringent health and safety workforce training programs Create something new: Contractors need training on how to offer LI rebates for Heat Pumps and Heat Pump Water Heaters Create something new: grants to invest in workforce, especially in rural & tribal communities
AFFORDABILITY
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> "Pure" discounts for EVs, NOT rebates/tax credits (+1) target resources/incentives to rural, coastal communities shift EV incentives to upfront rebate / discount rather than nonrefundable tax rebate allow for fuel switching in low income ee/wx programs from ETO and those offered by IOUs
UNCATEGORIZED
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> update land use regulation for siting of new fuel infrastructure to have safety, air quality, distance from schools / hospitals / EJ communities prioritized [comment: Very Important] The issues with siting may go beyond whether there are community benefits and to realistic conversations about impacts and communities being able to say no. For some types of facilities with AQ impacts, those may just be plain unacceptable for impacted community investment in battery recycling & safe disposal processes prioritize incentives for smaller EV's reducing demand for lithium + other extracted materials prioritize reducing VMT + growing transit access & non-car transit incentives over EV's + Low Carbon Fuels Need to learn more: I don't understand bullet 2 saying decarbonization will increase the cost of fossil fuels. What is this assumption based on? It would seem decarbonization leading to lower demand for fossil fuels could decrease the cost of fossil fuels.

Whiteboard Exercise 2: Transportation Electrification

Transportation Electrification <i>Strategies to Address Barriers</i>
ACCESS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> fund electrification of city-owned vehicles Charging infrastructure expansion programs should also include costs of maintenance of stations, especially in areas where EJ community members may seek charging. (+1) investment in transmission upgrades allowing for more energy reliability in rural communities EV charging stations coupled with transmission upgrades? prioritizing electrification of public transit & when new infrastructure is built out, electrifying it (+1) EV school buses, esp. in pollution-burdened communities Greater access to low-cost fast charging at gov or other buildings for good network so no concern about range anxiety. In rural areas, consider the needs of different groups (e.g. farmworking communities often organize own carpools due to hours for picking - how could investments/programs/transit support these group's needs?) invest in rural bike infrastructure + safety prioritize multi modal transportation planning and building
EDUCATION/RESOURCES/TOOLS

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Free & accessible resources re: EVs in rural, coastal and tribal communities. HOW to access them, not just what they are • trusted community institutions host regular multi-lingual ed programs to de-mystify EV benefits & incentives (+1) • grants for public transit extension to un-serviced areas (done w/community input) • adding educational content re: the impacts of pollution, electrification, etc in school curriculum? • training for salespeople @ dealerships to be an informed resource
WORKFORCE
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • research how these challenges are being tackled in other areas and implement best practices • Need salespeople at dealerships to understand EV incentives and able to explain to customers. • Utilize apprenticeship programs (+1) • reinforce EVITP training requirements • EV incentive programs specifically for small businesses w/ high VMT - ex contractors • require apprenticeship utilization goals for contractors in public contracting • Create diverse workforce goals to hire women, and BIOPC, disadvantaged communities (+1) • Utilities and private developers and owners should have workforce standards for maintenance and utilization goals for apprentices • pay family health and retirement • promote upskilling for existing workforce in electrical work. • promote partnerships between community colleges and union apprenticeship programs • utilize community workforce agreements
AFFORDABILITY
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • incentivize multifamily property owners to provide residential charging option (+2) • Disagree with issue statement - affordability issue is at point of purchase for vehicle, not in electricity rates. Need incentives for Low-Income Households to purchase ev's not to run out of money. Electricity is cheaper than gas. Need salespeople at dealerships to understand EV incentives and able to explain to customers. (+1) • Agree with the above sticky note about multifamily charging. this should be a retail rates, as that is what single family home residents can access. • Bike + Ebike rebates. Bike theft prevention like registration and places to safely lock bikes
UNCATEGORIZED
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does transportation electrification include street car, trolley, rail? • what does it mean to continue to incentivize driving, esp in cities, when more cars on the road = more roads = more parking lots and how this intersects with heat islands and air pollution for communities who cannot afford a car in the first place (+3) • prioritize incentives for smaller EV's reducing demand for lithium + other extracted materials • ensure local comprehensive plans are prioritizing reducing sprawl, building "climate friendly communities" where basic needs, jobs, etc are accessible without car

Whiteboard Exercise 3:

Building Electrification, Energy Efficiency, and Distributed Energy Resources

BE, EE, and DERs
<i>Strategies to Address Barriers</i>
ACCESS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continue to implement/support no-cost measures for low-income households.

- Continue to allocate funding to/support Healthy Homes programs to fund repairs/upgrades needed for EE and weatherization work
- coordinate efforts in building efficiency across programs, align requirements if possible (+1)
- LIHEAP threats are concerning re: access to EE and to basic heating (+1)
- municipalities model building electrification by transitioning all city buildings
- create interest and value in home energy scoring; not just for homeowners but for renters as well
- free energy assessments by neighborhood
- pollution fee on building new homes w/ fossil fuels appliances--> low-income energy assistance & efficiency programs
- invest in rural community microgrid infrastructure, with democratic ownership
- make utilities public & democratic

EDUCATION/RESOURCES/TOOLS

- tools for households to understand their bills, budgets, and money-saving programs all in one place
- storytelling programs highlighting benefits across class, climates
- provide information on ee in dollars saved for residential customers and ROI for businesses
- continue to electrify public schools & other shared spaces
- training for landlords on incentives & benefits to implement rental DHP programs (+1)

WORKFORCE

- Contractors need training on benefits of electrification and how to offer available incentives
- leverage connections with current ee training programs and energy programs at community colleges
- state-wide training for HVAC installers to understand incentive programs & benefits of DHPs etc
- Set apprenticeship utilization goals for industrial, commercial, and residential scale projects
- Utilizing existing apprenticeship training programs for up-skilling, re-skilling, etc.
- set goals for hiring women, biopic, and disadvantaged communities.
- Pay workers a living wage to afford their own building efficiency upgrades (+2)
- public jobs program for ee & wx
- better training for community orgs offering navigation services & long-term funding to maintain those programs
- pay family health and retirement
- ensure a skilled and trained workforce is performing EE, DER, and elecitrification work
- promote partnerships between community colleges and union apprenticeship programs

AFFORDABILITY

- The State has two sets of building incentive programs that don't work well together. BPA rebates for heat pumps and heat pump water heaters are not available for Low-Income Gas users to transition to electric. Energy Trust of Oregon Incentives can only be used for new gas equipment in areas served by Consumer Owned Utilities. Redirect Energy Trust Incentives from new gas equipment to electrification so Low-Income gas customers can access Low-Income rebates to electrify.
- there is massive demand for incentive programs - permanently fund these programs (+1) [comment: State Programs run out of money very fast]
- Continue rental home heat pump program
- tax data centers to fund resources for low income households (+1)
- pass + implement performance based ratemaking for utilities
- Increase natural gas supplier taxes to fund rebates for electrification

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> holistic ee services to ensure measure interaction is considered
UNCATEGORIZED
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Shift ETO benefits/incentives to include fuel-switching [comment: Very Important] research where in rural, coastal and tribal communities electrification can occur/is feasible require building efficiency upgrades for commercial and industrial Increase invest upgrades in school energy efficiency

Whiteboard Exercise 4: Developing Clean Electricity Generation and Transmission

<i>Developing Clean Electricity Generation and Transmission</i> <i>Strategies to Address Barriers</i>
ACCESS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Goals or minimum standards for % of energy produced locally for each utility prioritize community owned and democratically operated generation work on this item with others in the region to address the concern in the fourth bullet above Create a state definition of a Community Benefit Agreement and Community Benefit Plan utilize Oregon Consensus for critical energy infrastructure with stakeholder disagreement
EDUCATION/RESOURCES/TOOLS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> community input during processes that will impact their lives/living situations (+1) education programs must intervene in misinformation & fossil fuel industry funded disinformation Agree with the sticky above and add that engagement needs to happen early, when projects can be modified based on engagement, not at the end when the only goal may be to get a yes. begin community education on transmission expansion benefits far in advance to build common ground
WORKFORCE
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> set apprenticeship utilization goals utilize existing apprenticeship programs for up-skilling, re-skilling, etc pay a prevailing wage set strong health and safety training standards and protection promote community workforce agreements ensure state agency support to protect workers, and guide workers to graduation (journey status) set goals for hiring, training women, bipoc, disadvantaged workers (+1) Further update and enforce responsible contractor and labor standards in HB 2021/HB 4059 to protect workers promote partnerships between community colleges and union apprenticeship programs work with community colleges + local institutions now to ensure jobs can go to local community members pay family health and retirement
AFFORDABILITY
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> provide planning funding by community to plan/implement local solutions that aren't top down and consider community needs/goals (+1) Incentives for on site renewables and storage at Fire, EMS, emergency service hubs implement rate protections for low-income families as new generation is created (+1) Support for local utilities to maintain or replace old dams and other infrastructure with better alternatives.

UNCATEGORIZED	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • create a strong standard for community & Tribal engagement on new energy processes, where concerns are addressed, and common-ground solutions are implemented • Utilities should require community benefits in their large-scale resource RFPs and incentivize developers to prioritize community engagement and CBAs • Use the Oregon EJ mapping tool to target EJ communities for policy and infrastructure considerations. • improve fire risk safety measures for new transmission infrastructure • Support Tribally-owned/operated utilities

Virtual Meeting Chat

Lauren Rosenstein	All Participants	We're just going to wait until 9:05 to get started
John Maddalena he/him SEI-Energy Program Manager	All Participants	I apologize, I need to leave early this morning; we have an agency wide meeting at 10am.
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	I also will need to leave a bit early for another meeting
Lauren Rosenstein	All Participants	No problem. I'll be following up with info and other ways to comment.
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	Good morning, all! I am Jessica Reichers, Technology & Policy Manager at the Oregon Department of Energy. I will be monitoring the chat for questions and comments. Feel free to throw things into this chat as they come to you, or you can simply come off mute.
John Maddalena he/him SEI-Energy Program Manager	All Participants	John Maddalena (he/him) - Energy Program Manager @ Self Enhancement, Inc. (SEI)
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	Hi all, Sarah Wochele (she/her), Oregon Citizens' Utility Board (CUB). I was not here last time, so I am just generally curious to better understand what this phase is about
Christina Zamora	All Participants	Christina Zamora, Klamath and Lake Community Action Services, she/ella, curious about how instability at the federal level will affect this work and how we will navigate going forward
Jess, Rogue Climate she/they	All Panelists	Hello! Jess Grady-Benson (she.they), Rogue Climate, I'm curious about the connection between the different working groups and how to bring it all together in a cohesive energy strategy
Greer Klepacki CEP	All Participants	Greer Klepacki, Policy & Advocacy Manager at Community Energy Project, he/they. Interested to see where go from here with building on previous sessions' work

John Maddalena he/him SEI-Energy Program Manager	All Participants	curious how the rest of this year works out and impacts to the Energy community
Zach Mulholland	All Participants	Zach Mulholland - Beyond Toxics. Funding electrification rebate programs commensurate with need. Redirecting subsidies for new natural gas equipment (Energy Trust of Oregon) to rebates for efficient all-electric appliances.
John Seng	All Participants	John Seng (he/him) Policy Manager at Spark Northwest. Curious how we can best fortify Oregon's energy plans and programs against fed. threats
Amber Faist	All Participants	Amber Faist, Programs Director at the Northwest Native Chamber, Coquille Tribal Citizen.
Mark Healy	All Participants	Mark Healy, Coquille Tribe Climate Resilience Task Force. I am interested in how ODOE is thinking about federal policies that are opposed to what we are doing.
Alma Pinto	All Participants	Alma Pinto (she/her), NW Energy Coalition. I echo Christina's curiosity.
Eric Main he/him	All Participants	Eric Main (he/him) - Oregon Health Authority. Figuring out what is measurable at a community level.
Silvia	All Participants	Silvia Tanner (she/her), Multnomah County Office of Sustainability. Curious about how could this energy strategy voice the need for future research and analysis on how we can make sure all Oregonians can access the energy they need.
Lauren Rosenstein	All Participants	If a question, comment, or thought comes to you during Mary's presentation, please pop it in the chat or raise your hand if it is a clarifying question.
Zach Mulholland	All Participants	That is likely because you have to have significant taxable income to receive the tax credits. Oregon's EV rebate may be different since it has an income limit and is a rebate instead of credit.
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	Thanks, Zach. Appreciate the comment!
Hugh Arceneaux, ODOE	All Participants	For reference, these are the questions we're hoping to address with this review of Affordability research: Who has benefited from clean energy incentives? What factors contribute to disparities in uptake of incentives? What types of incentives may result in fewer disparities?
Hugh Arceneaux, ODOE	All Participants	For reference, these are the questions we're hoping to address with this review of Accessibility and Access research: What non-monetary factors are related to adoption of more efficient technologies? How do these non-monetary factors contribute to disparities in uptake of different technologies?
John Seng	All Participants	May have missed this - does adoption only count newly installed heat pumps in the last few years? I know a lot of homes in the South have had them for a long time
John Seng	All Participants	thanks!

Zach Mulholland	All Participants	High Financing costs are a major issue for solar. Lower interest costs would make more projects viable.
Hugh Arceneaux, ODOE	All Participants	For reference, this is the question we're hoping to address with this review of Education, Research, and Tools research: What forms of education, resources, and tools can effectively change consumer behavior?
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	Thanks for the comment, Zach!
Christina Zamora	All Participants	People in general are less likely to change their behavior if they perceive a loss
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	Thanks, Christina!
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	that was really interesting, thank you
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	Feel free to throw any questions in the chat, or you can just come off mute.
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	Thanks, Sarah. So glad you found it informative!
Jess, Rogue Climate she/they	All Panelists	is it possible to share out the slides now to refer back to in the conversation?
Jess, Rogue Climate she/they	All Panelists	oh yes! I will refer to those thank you
Hugh Arceneaux, ODOE	All Participants	Miro link: https://miro.com/app/board/uXjVleqb_gl=/?share_link_id=289785603573
Josh Price, ODOE	All Panelists	Miro link: Copy and paste miro link into your browser: https://miro.com/app/board/uXjVleqb_gl=/?share_link_id=963566925092
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	If you have any issues using Miro, you can also add your ideas in the chat, and we can add into the Miro for you.
Zach Mulholland	All Participants	Some of these bullets look different than those shown a moment ago
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	the ones in Miro are more correct? or other way?
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	yes thank you!
Lauren Rosenstein	All Participants	If you are joining as an attendee, you will not be able to join the Miro activity. You are always welcome to add your thoughts to the comment portal: Oregon Energy Strategy - Public Comment Portal · Customer Self-Service
Lauren Rosenstein	All Participants	https://odoe.powerappsportals.us/en-US/energy-strategy/
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	thanks for that silvia

Jess, Rogue Climate she/they	All Panelists	#NAME?
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	@jess not sure if you are familiar with this think tank, but they do great work talking about mining and transit solutions: https://climateandcommunity.org/transportation-mining/
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	particularly this report: https://climateandcommunity.org/research/more-mobility-less-mining/
Jess, Rogue Climate she/they	All Panelists	yes! I really appreciate their resources thanks Sarah
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	i love them
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	@John Seng - just wondering if your hand is still up from your previous question?
Jess, Rogue Climate she/they	All Panelists	#NAME?
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	there are less people in the pool to share costs of gas, low income folks stranded in this pool
Zach Mulholland	All Participants	So higher maintenance costs, same fuel costs? Fuel costs could come down as demand shifts to electricity and cheaper renewables.
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	Thanks, Sarah. Nicely said.
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	thanks for that explanation micharl
Zach Mulholland	All Participants	Got it, the higher costs include the percentage of renewable fuels
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	I like to think of the shared costs like sharing the maintenance of a shared road, which is something folks living in rural areas sometimes do. If four households use the road, then the cost to maintain it is split four ways. But, let's say one person gets a helicopter and no longer uses the road. They don't use the road, so don't pay the costs to maintain it. The cost to maintain doesn't change, but the cost is now split three ways instead of four, so for those households costs go up, even though the overall cost doesn't change.
Josh Price, ODOE	All Panelists	https://miro.com/app/board/uXjVleqb_gl=?share_link_id=714601288495
Josh Price, ODOE	All Panelists	It works best copy and paste the link
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	Jessica - thats a great analogy above
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	Thanks, Sarah. Analogies are almost always imperfect, but they help me understand things sometimes. :-)
Greer Klepacki CEP	All Participants	yes! safe bike lanes are soooo needed.

Greer Klepacki CEP	All Participants	where people can't park in them!
Sarah Wochele	All Participants	i do unfortunately have to jump to another mtg, thank you all for this collaborative brainstorming
Jess, Rogue Climate she/they	All Panelists	++ and in rural & coastal communities!
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	Thanks, Sarah! Appreciate your time and input!
Greer Klepacki CEP	All Participants	I didn't write that but assuming utilizing tribal owned utilities on projects?
Greer Klepacki CEP	All Participants	just my guess
Greer Klepacki CEP	All Participants	I've got another meeting, thank you!
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	Thank you, Greer!
Hugh Arceneaux, ODOE	All Participants	https://odoe.powerappsportals.us/en-US/energy-strategy/
Christina Zamora	All Participants	thank you, great info!
Jessica Reichers	All Participants	Thank you, all for your time and expertise!