Grade 5 – Opinion Writing Work Sample: Does Not Yet Meet

Task: Your class is studying about the history of animals and how they have contributed to human growth and development. You are given three articles about service animals.

Read the sources carefully to write an opinion essay in which you give your opinion about whether you agree with a new rule allowing only service dogs and miniature horses in public places, or whether you disagree with the rule. Make sure you clearly state your opinion and write several paragraphs supporting your opinion with reasons and details from the sources.

Scores, Justification of Student Evidence, and Suggested Areas of Student Improvement

Ideas and Content: 3

The essay communicates a clear opinion supported by relevant reasons, but explanations are basic, exaggerated, or inaccurate. It reflects understanding of health and safety concerns yet lacks accurate or balanced detail from the sources.

Evidence from Student Work: Ideas and Content
✓ **Clear Opinion and Purpose** ○ Explicit stance: *"The new law for service animals… is a good law."* ○ Maintains this opinion throughout, fulfilling "writer's purpose and main ideas are easy to understand."
✓ **Relevant but Simplified Details** ○ References general source ideas like health concerns and animal control: *"Monkeys and birds might spread deceases and other infections to public stores."* ○ However, exaggerations ("monkeys throwing punches," "horses and goats in hotels") weaken accuracy.
✓ **Development and Elaboration** ○ Attempts to provide reasoning (safety, hygiene, allergies) but lacks explanation or examples from the texts. ○ Several sentences repeat the same idea ("dogs are safer").
✓ **Focus and Relevance** ○ Focus remains consistent, though humor and exaggeration sometimes distract from clarity.

Organization: 3

The essay follows a basic structure with an introduction, body, and conclusion but lacks clear paragraph separation and effective transitions.

Evidence from Student Work: Organization
✓ **Introduction** ○ Starts clearly with the opinion statement but lacks a preview of reasons.
✓ **Grouping and Sequencing** ○ Related ideas (safety, hygiene, business concerns) appear, but paragraphs are merged together and repetitive.
✓ **Transitions and Flow** ○ Few connecting words ("Finally," "Also") are used inconsistently; ideas sometimes jump abruptly.
✓ **Conclusion and Closure** ○ Ends by restating opinion but adds an unrelated line ("they can protect there owner") without synthesis.

Voice: 4

The tone is confident and sincere. The student's enthusiasm and conviction come through clearly, though informal phrasing sometimes distracts from credibility.

Evidence from Student Work: Voice
✓ **Engaging and Expressive Tone** o Strong conviction: *"People who ran businesses were pleased."* o Passionate, direct, and reader-focused voice.
✓ **Sincerity and Personality** o The humor ("monkeys throwing punches") shows personality and engagement.
✓ **Audience Awareness** o Conversational phrasing connects with readers but could be more formal for academic writing.
✓ **Consistency of Tone** o Maintains positive tone throughout, reinforcing opinion effectively.

Word Choice: 3

Vocabulary is clear and readable but basic. Repetition and informal phrasing limit variety and precision.

Evidence from Student Work: Word Choice
✓ **Precision and Variety** o Repeats common terms like "law," "animal," and "dog."
✓ **Topic Vocabulary** o Includes "diseases," "allergies," "public," and "businesses," showing awareness of content.
✓ **Descriptive Language** o Attempts imagery ("monkeys throwing punches") but lacks sophistication or accuracy.
✓ **Tone and Audience Fit** o Everyday phrasing fits purpose but lacks academic polish.

Sentence Fluency: 2

Sentences are readable but frequently joined with commas or run together. Repetitive openings and informal phrasing reduce rhythm.

Evidence from Student Work: Sentence Fluency
✓ **Readable Flow** o Sentences are understandable and maintain momentum.
✓ **Repetition of Patterns** o Most begin with "I think," "Also," or "And."
✓ **Run-Ons and Punctuation Errors** o Example: *"The new law for service animals,in my opinion is a good law because some animals like snakes,lizards and even horses may be to dangerous or to large."*
✓ **Rhythm and Variety** o Conversational rhythm but limited sentence variety.

Conventions: 2

Frequent errors in punctuation, spelling, and capitalization make the writing uneven, though meaning remains clear.

Evidence from Student Work: Conventions
✓ **Punctuation and Spacing** ○ Missing commas ("The new law for service animals,in my opinion…") and inconsistent spacing.
✓ **Spelling** ○ Common misspellings: "deceases" (diseases), "won" (one), "to" (too), "there" (their).
✓ **Capitalization and Grammar** ○ Some sentences start with lowercase; inconsistent verb agreement ("people who ran bisinesses were pleased").

Use of Sources: 3

The essay shows general understanding of the readings, accurately referencing disease, behavior, and public safety concerns, but evidence is paraphrased loosely with no citations.

Evidence from Student Work: Use of Sources
✓ **Accurate Understanding** ○ Refers to relevant concerns from *Source #3* ("spread diseases," "large animals unsafe indoors").
✓ **Integration of Evidence** ○ No direct quotes or explicit attributions.
✓ **Balance of Sources** ○ Relies almost entirely on ideas from *Source #3*; no mention of monkeys from *Source #1* or variety from *Source #2*.
✓ **Citation and Attribution** ○ No source reference included.